## BEFORE THE OFFICE OF TAX APPEALS STATE OF CALIFORNIA

IN THE MATTER OF	THE APPEAL OF:	)		
		)		
ACFN FRANCHISED,	INC.,	) O	TA NO.	18124128
		)		
	APPELLANT.	)		
		)		

**CERTIFIED COPY** 

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

Sacramento, California

Wednesday, July 20, 2022

Reported by:

SARAH M. TUMAN, RPR Hearing Reporter

Job No.: 371230TA(A)

1	BEFORE THE OFFICE OF TAX APPEALS
2	STATE OF CALIFORNIA
3	
4	
5	IN THE MATTER OF THE APPEAL OF: )
6	ACFN FRANCHISED, INC., ) OTA NO. 18124128
7	APPELLANT. )
8	)
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS, taken at
16	400 R Street, Sacramento, California,
17	commencing at 9:35 a.m. and concluding
18	at 10:47 a.m. on Wednesday, July 20, 2022,
19	reported by Sarah M. Tuman, RPR, Hearing
20	Reporter in and for the State of California.
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	APPEARANCES:	
2		
3	Panel Lead:	ALJ ANDREW KWEE
4		
5	Panel Members:	ALJ JOSH LAMBERT ALJ SUZANNE BROWN
6		THE COLLECTE SHOWN
7	For the Appellant:	EDWARD DAVIS
8	TOT OHE TIPPETTAME	J. KERR
9	For the Respondent:	STATE OF CALIFORNIA
10	TOT OHE RESPONDENCE	DEPARTMENT OF TAX AND FEE ADMINISTRATION
11		SCOTT CLAREMON
12		CHAD BACCHUS JASON PARKER
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

1		IN	DEX		
2					
3		EXHI	B I T S		
4	(Appellant's Exhib	its 1-11 w	ere recei	ved at page	8)
5	(Department's Exhi	bits A-C w	ere recei	ved at page	8)
6					
7					
8					
9					
10		PRESE	NTATION		
11					PAGE
12	By Mr. Davis				10
13	By Mr. Bacchus				14
14					
15	APPELLANT'S				
16	WITNESSES:	DIRECT	CROSS	REDIRECT	RECROSS
17	Jeffery Kerr	20			
18	(Further)	47			
19					
20		CLOSIN	G ARGUMEN	ΙΤ	
21					PAGE
22	By Mr. Davis				52
23	By Mr. Bacchus				57
24					
25					

Sacramento, California; Wednesday, July 20, 2022 9:35 a.m.

2.4

JUDGE KWEE: All right. Thank you. We're ready to go on the record.

We're opening the record in the Appeal of ACFN Franchised, Inc. This matter is being held before the Office of Tax Appeals. The OTA Case Number is 18124128. And today's date is Wednesday, July 20th, 2022. The time is approximately 9:35 a.m., and this hearing is being conducted in Sacramento, California. And it's also being livestreamed on OTA's YouTube channel.

Today's panel -- today's hearing is being heard by a panel of three Administrative Law Judges. That's myself, Andrew Kwee, I will be the law -- the lead Administrative Law Judge. And to my right is Suzanne Brown, and to my left is Josh Lambert. And they're the three -- we are the three members of this panel.

All three of us will meet after the hearing and produce a written opinion as equal participants. Although I will be conducting the hearing today, any Judge on this panel may ask questions or otherwise participate to ensure that we have all the information needed to decide this appeal.

Just for the record, would the parties please

1	state their names and who they represent? And I'll start
2	with representatives for the tax agency, CDTFA.
3	MR. BACCHUS: Chad Bacchus.
4	MR. CLAREMON: Scott Claremon. And we also have
5	Jason Parker in attendance.
6	JUDGE KWEE: Okay.
7	And for Appellant, would you please state your
8	name and who you represent? Would the people please state
9	your name and who you represent?
10	MR. DAVIS: I'm Edward Davis. I represent ACFN
11	and its CEO, Jeff Kerr.
12	MR. KERR: I'm Jeffrey Kerr, founder and CEO of
13	ACFN.
14	JUDGE KWEE: Okay. Thank you.
15	And, Mr. Kerr, is your microphone on?
16	MR. KERR: It doesn't look like the light's on.
17	JUDGE KWEE: Oh. So you can push there's a
18	little button. If you push that, the light should come
19	on.
20	MR. KERR: Better now?
21	JUDGE KWEE: Perfect. Thank you.
22	Okay. So with that said, there was just one
23	preliminary matter.
24	I noticed that I had during the prehearing
25	conference, I believe, for Appellant's representative, you

indicated that you were going with an April 10, 2019, exhibit list consisting of 11 exhibits. I did note that there was a subsequent submission after our first hearing conference on January 9th, 2020 -- so about nine months later.

That one contained the 19 exhibits. And I just wanted to confirm with you that you wanted to roll it back to the 11 exhibits.

MR. DAVIS: The -- the 11 exhibits -- I believe the errata sheet was to actually coordinate those. And then there -- it says it brings it down to the 11th. So there were two sets. What we did was coordinating saying it was only the 11.

JUDGE KWEE: Okay.

2.4

MR. DAVIS: That was the purpose. So if those dates were mixed up, my apologies, your Honor.

JUDGE KWEE: Okay. Perfect. Yes. So I did have that. And I did distribute the 11 exhibits; so I think we are good there.

I would ask, could you also double check that you have your microphone on? Because they aren't picking up your voice on the livestream. It should be a green light that comes on.

MR. DAVIS: It's a green light. And I am speaking directly into the microphones.

1 Okay. Cool. Thank you. JUDGE KWEE: 2 So for the exhibits for this Appeal, then, consist of CDTFA's three Exhibits, A through C. And these 3 4 were discussed at the prehearing conference and 5 distributed to the parties via email after the prehearing conference. 6 7 And for Appellant, I have Exhibits 1 through 11. Those were also discussed and distributed following the 8 9 prehearing conference. My understanding is that neither 10 party has objections to any of the exhibits offered for 11 the admission. 12 Is the summary I provided correct for CDTFA? MR. BACCHUS: Yes, it is. 13 14 JUDGE KWEE: Okay. 15 And for Appellant; is that correct? 16 MR. DAVIS: Yes, your Honor. 17 JUDGE KWEE: Okay. Then Exhibits 1 through 11 18 for Appellant and A through C for CDTFA are admitted into 19 the record -- evidentiary record. 20 (Appellant's Exhibit Nos. 1-11 were received in 21 evidence by the Administrative Law Judge.) 22 (Department's Exhibit Nos. A-C were received in 23 evidence by the Administrative Law Judge.) 2.4 JUDGE KWEE: And for the witnesses, we just have 25 one witness for Appellant, Jeffrey D. Kerr, the president

1 and CEO of Appellant and its holding companies. 2 present today, and there are no objections to hearing 3 testimony from Mr. Kerr today. 4 Is that summary correct, CDTFA? 5

MR. BACCHUS: Yes, it is.

JUDGE KWEE: Okay.

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2.4

25

And for Appellant, is that summary accurate?

MR. DAVIS: Yes.

JUDGE KWEE: Okay. Great.

So just a reminder, there is only one issue in this -- this appeal. That issue is whether the ATM franchise fees -- the initial franchise fees are taxable as a part of the sale of ATMs.

The parties agree to the calculation of the ATM franchise fees. And there were other items included in the audit, which are not at issue in Appeal today. only issue is the ATM franchise fees and whether they are taxable or nontaxable.

And as far as the time estimates, we have allocated 10 minutes for Appellant's opening presentation. Following that will be 15 minutes allocated for CDTFA's opening presentation. And then we'll have testimony from the witness allocated at 25 minutes. Following that, we'll have ten minutes per party for closing remarks.

Is there any -- is that an accurate summary of

1	the time estimates? Or are there any concerns with the
2	time estimates provided?
3	MR. DAVIS: No. We're we're fine with that.
4	JUDGE KWEE: Okay. Great.
5	Then we are ready to start. If there's no
6	questions of the Office of Tax Appeals before we get
7	started, then I will turn it over to Appellant's
8	representative to begin their opening presentation.
9	You have ten minutes until 9:50.
10	Thank you.
11	MR. DAVIS: Thank you.
12	
13	OPENING STATEMENT
14	
15	MR. DAVIS: Good morning, members of the panel.
16	The evidence will show that ACFN is a registered
17	California franchise or of a proprietary business
18	model, which provides private ATM services.
19	The ATM services, which are the business of ACFN,
20	are consumer ATM credit/debit transaction for individual
21	checking and savings account records, which were all
22	regulated directly by the FDIC. That is the core of their
23	business.
24	JUDGE KWEE: Oh. Mr. Davis, I'm sorry to
25	interrupt. I'm getting feedback that I they can't hear

1 you on the livestream. Is it possible that you could move 2 your microphone just a little bit closer to you so that 3 we're able to have a record on our livestream of what 4 you're saying? 5 MR. DAVIS: Can you hear me now? Oh. That is -- I believe that's 6 JUDGE KWEE: 7 perfect. 8 MR. DAVIS: Oh. You're not kidding. It's a very limited directional mic. 9 10 JUDGE KWEE: It is very picky. We have a lot of people mention that, and I apologize. But what you just 11 12 did -- that helped a lot. Thank you. 13 MR. DAVIS: Based on the audit reports, as -- as 14 well as the decisions that have been handed out so far, 15 there is a fundamental misunderstanding of what ACFN's They are a financial services business. 16 business is. 17 They are regulated by the FDIC. That means they're in the 18 banking business, they don't sell ATM's. 19 An ATM is merely a tool. It's for

An ATM is merely a tool. It's for telecommunications only. It's actually a dumb circuit. So the evidence today -- and we'll go through it -- will show that all of the services that are provided here are actually provided -- provided in the network beyond the ATM -- beyond the ATM -- no services happen inside of that ATM.

20

21

22

23

2.4

25

So ACFN's not in the retail business of selling ATMs. Any ATMs that come as part of, if they happen to take them as part of the franchise, are fully consumed by those parties. ACFN doesn't make them, they don't install them, they don't supply them in any fashion.

They do make them available, and the franchisees can decide to use them or not. We'll get into more detail about that.

ACFN charges a franchise fee for the legal right to conduct and act and be part of that business. A franchise is a legal right. It's actually a series of licenses. The predominance of what the franchise covers based on its historical -- how it was put together historically is that it is intangible.

All of the licenses that come -- all of the services that come off of those licenses that are allowed -- are intangible. So in exchange for that fee, a license is granted that allows the franchisee the legal right to offer federally regulated consumer credit and debit financial services. That is the core of the business, not ATMs.

And franchise was statutorily created. And it started out merely as being part of the securities regulation in the state because they were offered as private placements. Then the Attorney General, in 1969 --

there were so many issues with how those presented and sold. There was an Attorney General's opinion.

After the Attorney General's opinion, California took the lead and both was the first state to create an entire section in its code dealing with franchises. And that -- those franchises are regulated as similar to any security. That's very similar to what happens under the FCC.

As a matter of fact, the United States Government adopted California's model in 1972. So that model requires two things: It requires, obviously, an agreement -- an SPA, a purchase and sale agreement -- which is called a "Franchise Agreement," that details in detail what those licenses entail. And those licenses entail a series of pieces of intellectual property and rights to intellectual property.

Once again, the ATM is merely a tool. It does only one thing. It's no different than a telephone switch. It does one thing. It opens a channel so that whoever the card member is at the other end of that can communicate securely with its own bank -- that bank has a different system. It has to be inside of that system.

The ATM has no smarts in it for that purpose. It does one thing. It opens a channel for you to be able to communicate with your own bank. According to all of the

FDIC regulations, once again, it's only a tool. And we'll step through that piece by piece.

And that system is secure. Meaning, all banks communicate in mainframe language. Some of them still are not digitized. They go through digital to analog translation. And that's way beyond this.

The point there is an ATM has no ability to interact other than to open a channel -- period -- for the card holder to communicate with its own bank through the internet or through two-twist wire -- obviously, a telephone line -- most, now, it's internet. And everything else happens at the bank in a secure location.

So with that, that's what the evidence at the appropriate point -- we're ready to begin testimony.

JUDGE KWEE: Okay. I will let CDTFA have their opening presentation, and then I'll turn it back to you for testimony from the witness.

Okay. So when you're ready to begin, CDTFA.

## OPENING STATEMENT

22 MR. BACCHUS: Good morning.

The only issue in this Appeal is whether automated teller machine, or ATM, franchise fees are taxable as part of the sale of ATMs.

Appellant is a California corporation that operates an ATM franchise, selling ATM franchise licenses to franchisees. According to Appellant's Exhibit 5, which is their Franchise Agreement, for a total contract amount of \$\$29,500 Appellant provides the following: A license to operate under its franchise, one ATM, one extra cash cassette, operational software, financial forms, financial and banking transaction processing services, and training.

Of the \$\$29,500 contract amount, \$\$4,995 represents the cost of the ATM. The Franchise Agreement requires franchisees to purchase additional ATMs, cash cassettes, and other related equipment and supplies exclusively from Appellant.

In the audit found in the Department's Exhibit C, the Department concluded that the franchise fees were part of the sale of ATMs and that the entire contract amount was taxable. Appellant's Disclosure Document, found in Appellant's Exhibit 6, lists Appellant's new franchisees during the liability period. The Department used this list to calculate unreported taxable franchise tax fees of just over \$196,000.

Revenue and Taxation Code Section 6051 imposes sales tax on a retailer for its retail sales of tangible personal property in this state. Section 6091 states that all other retailer's gross receipts are presumed subject

to tax. Section 6012 defines "gross receipts" as the total amount of the sale price without any deduction for the cost of the property sold, the cost of the materials used, labor or service cost, or any other expense.

Sections 6011 and 6012 state that the total amount of the sale price includes any services that are a part of the sale of tangible personal property.

Regulation 1501 provides that services that are not part of the sale of tangible personal property are not subject to sales tax.

In these cases, the person rendering the service is the consumer of any tangible personal property that person uses incidentally in rendering the service. The true object of the contract, whether the purchaser's real purpose is to acquire the service per se, or the tangible personal property, is the test used in determining whether a particular transaction involves the sale of tangible personal property or the performance of a service with an incidental transfer of tangible personal property.

To be clear, anything other than the incidental transfer of tangible personal property would constitute a taxable sale of tangible personal property. Here, there is no dispute that the transactions at issue included the transfer of an ATM and other tangible personal property. Moreover, the ATM cannot be said to be incidental to the

provision of a service. The ATM is the mechanism used to conduct the banking business.

2.4

Appellant is in the business of selling. The license or franchise Appellant sells is for the rights to place an ATM in a specific location to conduct those banking services. Without the ATM, the franchisees have no way to benefit from the purchase of a franchise.

Given the facts, there can be no reasonable argument that the ATMs are incidental to the performance of a service. Because the contracts at issue involve a transfer of tangible personal property that was not incidental to the provision of a service the transaction is subject to sales tax including any services that were a mandatory services part of the sale of tangible personal property.

There is no dispute that Appellant provided the ATMs, or sold the ATMs, only to those that entered into a Franchise Agreement and paid the required contract amount. Appellant has not provided any evidence that the franchise fees were optional or that acquiring the ATMs were optional. And in fact, the Franchise Agreement indicates that the franchise fees and the ATMs are integrated and not separable.

Accordingly, the franchise fees are mandatory to obtain the transfer of the ATMs, and the entire contract

amount is subject to sales tax. This result is consistent with how the Department has historically handled transactions involving franchise fees and the transfer of tangible personal property.

Annotation 330.3330 states that the initial franchise fee and the additional payment fee for the use of machines which are leased by a corporation to its franchisees are taxable. The backup letter to this annotation, which was written in 1969, indicates that the franchisee was required to pay a franchise fee of \$350 to become a franchisee and to gain use of equipment necessary to run the franchise.

Similarly, in the appeal at issue here, the franchisee must pay the franchise fee to obtain an ATM, which is necessary to run the franchise.

In its briefing, Appellant relies on the court case of Dell v. The Superior Court County of the -- of the City and County of San Francisco, but Appellant's reliance on Dell is misplaced. Dell merely holds that, with respect to a mixed transaction -- and in Dell that involved charges for an optional warranty contract -- the application of tax to charges for optional nontaxable service is not dependent upon whether the charges are separately stated unless a statute or regulation expressly requires that such charges be separately stated.

1	Dell simply does not apply to bundle
2	transactions, which are at issue here, where a mandatory
3	service is part of the sale of tangible personal property.
4	And Dell certainly does not stand for the proposition
5	that, in a bundled transaction, services that are part of
6	the sale can be rendered nontaxable because a portion of
7	the lump sum price can be readily allocated to the
8	services.
9	Here, there's no dispute that the franchisees
10	could not get the ATMs without without also paying the
11	franchise fee. The fee was mandatory, and these
12	constitute bundled transactions. Thus Dell is
13	inapplicable to this appeal. The franchise fees are part
14	of the sale of the ATMs and are subject to sales tax.
15	Based on the foregoing, the Department requests
16	that the Appeal be denied. Thank you.
17	JUDGE KWEE: Okay.
18	So then I will turn it back to Appellant's
19	representative for the witness testimony.
20	MR. DAVIS: Thank you.
21	JUDGE KWEE: Oh. And before we get started, I
22	would swear in the witness.
23	Mr. Kerr, if you would, raise your hand.
24	///
25	

1	JEFFERY KERR,
2	called as a witness on behalf of the Appellant, having
3	first been duly sworn by the Administrative Law Judge, was
4	examined and testified as follows:
5	
6	THE WITNESS: I do.
7	JUDGE KWEE: All right. Thank you.
8	
9	DIRECT EXAMINATION
10	
11	BY MR. DAVIS:
12	Q Mr. Kerr, what is your position at ACFN?
13	A Owner and CEO.
14	Q How long have you been in that position?
15	A Since 2003.
16	Q Are you also considered a pioneer in the field?
17	A Yeah. For what we do, yes.
18	Q What is an ISO?
19	A Independent Sales Organization.
20	(Reporter interrupted)
21	ISO is an Independent Sale Organization. So it's
22	a company that aggregates services for small
23	operators.
24	(Reporter interrupted)
25	What's an ISO?

1	Q What is an ISO?
2	So ACFN is an ISO?
3	A Correct.
4	Q And being an ISO, did you have to register with
5	the FDIC?
6	A Yes. With all the national networks, Cirrus plus
7	STAR, all those get a sponsorship sponsoring bank and
8	comply with a whole bunch of the regulations in the
9	banking industry, yes.
10	Q So so all of those licenses actually came with
11	the franchise?
12	A They obtained them by becoming a franchisee.
13	Correct.
14	Q Okay. When let's start from the beginning.
15	What is a franchise? And what do you have to do
16	in order to get one of those?
17	A Right. So obviously, it's a way of operating a
18	business. It's business "know-how." It's clearly
19	intangible property. And we teach people how to what
20	we do, mostly, is marketing services. We do some
21	accounting, and, of course, we do some compliance work.
22	Franchisees don't come to us even 1 percent of
23	the decision is not based on the type of equipment we use.
24	That's not even a question in our conversations.
25	It's where do we operate? How much revenue is

generated? What kind of income can they expect to earn by joining our business? And the machine is definitely ancillary. It's -- it's a side thing.

Do we use a Triton? Do we use a Nautilus

Hyosung? Do we use Genmega? Do we use this -- this

configuration? That configuration?

2.4

We have our preferences, but it's not at all what the business -- it's not about the ATM. It's about the income it generates, which relates to the location where it's placed, and of course, operating in a compliant way, the safe way. And that's what we teach people to do.

Q In registering and becoming a franchise owner, did the State require you to do certain things in order to get the -- the B license tax write-off?

A Absolutely. So we have to have a Franchise Disclosure Document; we have to have a Franchise Agreement; we have to file paperwork every year with the State; we have to pay fees to be a licensed franchisor; and, yeah, we have to do a lot of things every year.

Compliance -- we have counsel for that. That's a separate issue from here.

When a person calls us -- I think it's an important point to make -- when a person wants to buy an ATM, they don't come to ACFN. That's a ridiculous assumption, or -- or -- or understanding, of what we do.

If you want to buy an ATM, you Google "buy an ATM," you'll never find ACFN. If you call me to say, "I want to buy an ATM," I'm going to say I can't sell you one because you're not one of my franchisees.

2.4

If you want to buy an ATM from someone else, you can conclude the transaction in 5 minutes, you pay your sales tax, you're done.

You want to buy one from me, you got to go through the disclosure process, you got to read the FDD, you got to have the 14-day wait period, you got to pay a franchise fee, you got to complete training, and then -- then you can buy an ATM machine.

But we don't -- we facilitate the purchase of ATM machines through Triton so that franchisees can get good pricing. We're not in the business of selling ATM machines. It's something we do, but you want to buy an ATM machine, you're not going to buy it from ACFN. You have to buy a franchise.

So there's some distinctions here.

Q Was there ever a situation where someone came to buy a franchise and didn't want the ATMs?

A Yep. That does happen. Actually, happens a lot, now. It used to happen less, before; but it absolutely happens. And there's a few scenarios:

One is they're buying -- we do acquisitions; so

they're buying locations that already have the ATMs. So they're buying based on the multiple of the income generated by those locations, not which ATM is there or what the cost of the ATM is.

It's based on the revenue generated. That's how the value is determined. And the machines just come with the locations because we acquired them that way.

Sometimes they're in the ATM business before they join us; so they may have equipment.

By the way, I want to correct one statement that was made in the opening and -- that they have to buy all the machines from ACFN -- that's factually incorrect. The agreement actually states they can buy from alternative services, but they have to be approved.

They have to be approved so they comply with our network and fit within our skill set so that we are able to support when there are disputes or what have you. So it has to be approved, but they can buy from alternative service. They don't have to by from ACFN.

Q So further question, on the services that are there, the financial services, all those financial services, indeed, have separate individual licenses and contracts you have to -- to -- obtain in order to put this network together; is that correct?

A Correct.

2.4

1	Q	Okay.
2	A	Yes.
3	Q	So this network actually happens where?
4	A	At the network level.
5	Q	Okay.
6	A	The ATM just calls in.
7	Q	So so so the the ATM is like a
8	telephon	e; correct?
9	A	Yep.
10	Q	Okay. Nowadays have we moved further than just
11	an ATM?	Is are there other devices that are used?
12	A	Yes. We we we have two other products that
13	we are p	romoting now: Cell phone charging stations and
14	vending	machines that specifically vend over the counter
15	pharmace	uticals.
16		Because they fit in the same skill set. They
17	process	the same transactions over the same networks. And
18	franchis	ees have the skill set to operate them. And we
19	have the	skill set to secure contracts to place them that
20	appeal t	o the same customers we work with.
21		So we have other products, yeah.
22	Q	What's actually inside an ATM?
23	A	Cash, obviously. And very specific computer
24	boards t	hat can't do anything other than the intended call
25	the netw	ork so they ask if this transaction can be

1 approved -- specific purpose components. That's it. 2 So specifically, the only thing in there is a 0 3 Actually, a connection to either the internet or switch? 4 a telephone; is that correct? 5 Yeah. Wireless device. Α 6 0 Okay. And that device merely opens a circuit; 7 correct? Yeah. 8 Α 9 And that circuit goes to the internet; correct? Q 10 Α Yeah. Mostly. It's a portal? 11 0 12 Α Yeah. 13 So that ATM does nothing else? There are no 0 14 other services provided there? 15 Α No, that's correct. 16 Q Okay. 17 Just makes a phone call. Α 18 It only makes a phone call. So it is actually Q incidental. 19 20 It's a communication device, yeah. Α 21 0 That's it. Now, the other services that are there and the 22 23 software that's actually provided and, ad nauseam, in the 2.4 disclosure document as required -- does it actually do 25 the -- the software there? Does -- is it actually loaded

1 onto that ATM? 2 Α By a manufacturer before it's shipped. And 3 it's -- there's nothing there that is specific to ACFN. 4 It's totally standard. 5 And, yeah. There's different ATM manufacturers, different models. They all have the same software. 6 7 just does one simple function. So it's not --That's just for the --8 0 We don't write the software. We don't develop 9 Α 10 it. We don't produce it. Q And you don't -- and you don't load any software 11 12 on? 13 Α No. No. 14 The software -- the software I'm discussing or 0 15 asking about is lead? 16 Α Oh. 17 That comes out on the -- the audit report is lead 0 generation, et cetera. What is that software? 18 19 Right. So that has nothing to do with the ATM. Α 20 That's the way we track our leads and do our marketing to secure locations for our franchisees to install our 21 2.2 machines. 23 And that's also nonproprietary. It's all -- it's 2.4 like Sales Force but different -- that you use we just put

our leads --

25

1 Where does it reside? 0 2 Α The cloud -- just somewhere. 3 It's -- it's -- it's for a laptop? 0 4 Α Yeah. You can access from anywhere. 5 But -- but you don't get there from the 0 Yeah. ATM? 6 7 No. Α No. And it's not loaded on the ATM? 8 Q It has nothing to do with the ATM. 9 Α No. 10 So ACFN doesn't manufacture? Q 11 Α No. 12 You don't install? 0 13 Α No. 14 You don't service in any way? Q 15 Α No. Okay. And try to -- do they actually drop-ship 16 Q 17 these? 18 Α Correct. 19 Okay. Q 20 It's shipped direct to the franchisee. Α 21 0 So hence, the issue we had early on with sales 22 tax versus use tax that took two years to settle; is that 23 correct? 2.4 Α I'm sorry. I didn't follow the question. 25 Your franchisees, from the very beginning, had 0

been instructed, when they purchase something, they have to pay a sales tax on it; correct?

A Correct. They're required to open an account with what used to be with the Board of Equalization and pay sales tax directly in their retails.

Q Okay.

2.4

- A We don't do that.
- Q But there is a dispute whether it was sales tax or use tax; is that correct?
  - A I don't know.
  - Q Okay.
  - A Sorry.
- Q Anyway, the -- the issue is ACFN's not in the ATM business. Was the ATM only offered as convenience?
- A Only as part of the franchise to generate the income. There are hundreds of companies in the ATM business that just sell ATMs, and we're not one of them. It's not what we do. It's not our business model.

And by the way, I don't think there's any dispute the franchise fee as an intangible property is not taxable. And if we charge 299 -- \$29,500, and the agreement clearly identifies the ATM as \$4,995, seems to me that a reasonable conclusion, that is -- that the rest of that is the franchise fee, the business know-how, and intangible.

1	Seems reasonable to me. Layman's terms
2	understanding obviously, I'm not an attorney but if
3	it's \$\$29,500, and the agreement clearly states the ATM is
4	\$\$4,995, then the rest is the franchise fee the rest is
5	intangible property. That's a reasonable conclusion in my
6	opinion. And the fact that we're licensed as a
7	franchisor.
8	So I don't know how to make the leap that the
9	whole thing is taxable.
10	But, anyway, I just want to
11	Q Does ACFN even include an ACFN in anything it
12	does, now, in terms of franchise?
13	A You mean ATM? No.
14	After the audit, we changed that to make sure
15	there's no possible misunderstanding moving forward. We
16	just took it out, yeah.
17	Q And that that did not change the price of
18	the of the franchise?
19	A No. No.
20	Q So once again, just to be clear, ACFN does not
21	install any software either?
22	A No. No.
23	Q So what's included excuse me what's
24	included in the initial training?
25	A So the heart of the training is generating leads

and our marketing services.

2.4

Like I said, nobody comes to ACFN to buy an ATM. You can buy an ATM from hundreds of companies. All of them would sell them for less than we do. We sell them at higher prices because we do all the marketing to find the locations.

The ATM has no value unless it's at a location producing revenue; right? So we charge more. That's why you wouldn't come to us to simply buy an ATM. But with that, in training, we focus on marketing services: Where do we want to put them?

In our case, mostly in hospitality. We have ATMs in more than 2,000 hotels. It's a safe environment, it's -- we can charge higher fees, we get more -- conversion rate is higher. So we train franchisees to scout for these locations. We train them to collaborate with us to help us secure these agreements.

We go over, of course, compliance. That's a very important part of what we do. We have to do things in a certain way so if there's an audit, or Visa or MasterCard or one of the networks or a bank looks at you, you have all the right stickers, you have the correct parameters on your machine, you're keeping correct records, you could respond to journal dispute.

So we go over all the compliance stuff. We

1	explain, of course, to build the value, the network
2	licenses that we bring to the table, what bookkeeping
3	services we're going to provide. Because we pay the
4	locations. We do all the computations for them. They're
5	not, you know they don't have staff to do that kind of
6	stuff.
7	And of course, we do train them how to program a
8	terminal and when you receive it and install it.
9	But the heart of training is absolutely
10	generating leads and marketing and compliance.
11	Q But after that training, they have to get
12	somebody to install it; correct?
13	A Yeah. They can hire somebody or do it
14	themselves. Depends on their skill set, you know?
15	Q What is the what is the "operations manual"
16	that's included in there, also?
17	A It's a reference for them to how to operate
18	their business and goes through all the things they need
19	to know to operate their business properly.
20	Q Okay. In that reference manual, it is designed
21	for ACFN; correct?
22	A Yeah. That's our program.
23	Q Is that considered a trade secret?
24	A Absolutely.

Okay. So that's also part of the intellectual

25

Q

1	property?		
2	A Absolutely.		
3	Q Okay. In putting together the disclosure		
4	document and getting it through the State based on		
5	statutory requirements, all of the services, the network		
6	services, we're talking about have been separately		
7	delineated? I mean by that, they've been separately		
8	discussed in, or referenced to, in the disclosure		
9	document?		
10	A Yes.		
11	Q Okay. The Franchise Agreement is, really,		
12	designed as a purchase and sale agreement; is that		
13	correct?		
14	A For a franchise, yes.		
15	Q Okay. It's specifically designed and meets the		
16	State requirements?		
17	A Oh, absolutely.		
18	Q Per statute?		
19	A Absolutely.		
20	Q So the disclosure document is also based on		
21	excruciating detail both in the code and the regulations		
22	of the statute; is that not correct?		
23	A It's prepared by counsel that specializes in that		
24	area, yes.		
25	Q Okay.		

1 А Very costly. 2 0 The services, the network service, and the financial banking services we've discussed -- can each one 3 4 of those be separated and stand on their own? 5 They're each distinct. Absolutely. Α Can they all be subcontracted? 6 If you didn't 7 want to do portion? 8 Α Oh, no. No. No. No. No. It's not economically practical for an small operator to do any of 9 10 that -- too much fees, too much compliance cost. Not 11 really, no. But it could be done? 12 0 13 Α It could be done. Sure. 14 Okay. And so they can stand on their own? 0 15 are distinct from each other? 16 Α Correct. Yes. 17 So they're not actually bundled? 0 18 No, they're not. Α 19 But in order to complete certain of your -- if Q 20 you only did debits and not credits, or you limited your 21 financial services, would you have to offer all of the services that you're doing? 22 23 We have to be members of all the national А 24 networks; otherwise, we'd have too many transactions 25 declined. So we have to offer all of them, but each one

1 of them has a separate agreement and different pricing and 2 different rules and, yes. 3 So they're pretty distinct from each other? 4 Α They are. They are, but we need all of them to 5 function properly, yeah. So you -- okay. All right. 6 0 7 Yep. We pay fees every year to each network and Α have to sign their agreement and compliance and all that. 8 Okay. We had one exhibit that we noted. And it 9 Q 10 is of significance because it details one of these 11 transactions. As a matter of fact, that was one of the issues, but it speaks directly to the services. 12 And this would be Exhibit 9. And I would draw 13 14 your attention to -- in Exhibit 9, there was a letter, and 15 there were attachments. And the attachment we're 16 directing you to is Attachment B. 17 I'm going to hand this -- for the record, I'm 18 handing a paper copy of Appellant's Exhibit 9 and looking 19 at Exhibit B to the letter N. 20 Okay. Exhibit 9, Attachment --JUDGE KWEE: 21 MR. DAVIS: Attachment B. 22 JUDGE KWEE: Okay. 23 MR. DAVIS: For the record, I'm handing it to the 2.4 witness, Jeff. 25 ///

1	BY MR. DAVIS:		
2	Q	In looking at that, is a that a typical	
3	transaction?		
4	А	Yes.	
5	Q	As a typical transaction, does that clearly state	
6	and separate what those individual services are doing?		
7	А	Yes.	
8	Q	Okay. So those those services are distinct,	
9	they are	separate, and they end up with separate cash	
10	flows; correct?		
11	А	Correct.	
12	Q	Okay. So they're not bundled, are they?	
13	А	No.	
14	Q	Okay. And your other services are all	
15	intangibles; correct?		
16	А	To my understanding, yes.	
17	Q	Okay.	
18	А	Absolutely.	
19	Q	And everything else that's licensed is	
20	intangible?		
21	А	Correct.	
22	Q	Okay. So as you said earlier, a logical reading	
23	of the Franchise Agreement and the fact that it has to be		
24	registered and its history is an intangible. Logically,		
25	they can be separated, and they do stand in operate		

1	separately?
2	A Correct. Everything outside the \$4,995.
3	In fact, the position the State is taking, if I
4	can say it that the whole thing is taxable means
5	that we have no intangible property at all? Our franchise
6	model, our business know-how has no value at all?
7	If they want to tax the whole thing, well, that's
8	what it is. That's the sole reason people come to us.
9	How would that have no value at all? I don't understand
10	that at all.
11	Q So once again, in summary, question all
12	network operations take places on the network; correct?
13	A Yes.
14	Q And that network lies beyond I'm using a
15	term lies beyond the ATM?
16	A Correct.
17	Q So the ATM is no different than a telephone?
18	A Doesn't make any decisions. That is correct.
19	Q So decisions and ACFN loads no software there?
20	A Nope.
21	Q It does not install them?
22	A No.
23	Q So it takes no it takes no position with and,
24	actually, is not part of in any way the OEM chain
25	Original Equipment Manufacturer?

1	A No. No.
2	Q So with Triton what is your actual position
3	with Triton?
4	A Officially, we're a distributor. So we by
5	aggregating the purchases of all our franchisees,
6	facilitating all of them to buy from Triton, we get better
7	pricing. It's a volume thing.
8	Q Once again, that goes to convenience?
9	A Yes, of course.
10	Q And it has never been an absolute requirement
11	A No.
12	Q based on your disclosure document, that a
13	franchisee has to buy your equipment?
14	A No. They can buy from an alternative source
15	that's approved so that it fits within our network, and
16	they can do what it needs to do. But they don't have to
17	buy it from us.
18	Q And the requirement there is one so that they fit
19	and operate with the network is the requirement?
20	A Correct.
21	Q Okay. And the franchise statute and the
22	franchise requirements for it to be a franchise do they
23	require uniformity?
24	A Franchise Agreement?
25	Q Yes.

1	A We're looking for uniformity, yes.
2	Q Okay.
3	A That's an operational thing just to make sure
4	that we can operate the business.
5	MR. DAVIS: No further questions at this time,
6	your Honor.
7	JUDGE KWEE: Okay.
8	I'll turn it over to CDTFA.
9	CDTFA, do you have any questions for the witness?
10	MR. BACCHUS: No questions.
11	JUDGE KWEE: Okay.
12	I did have a couple of questions. I just for
13	the witness I'm hoping you could clarify.
14	In the agreement with the customer, is there
15	any is there anywhere where it's specifically laid out
16	in detail what is provided in exchange for the initial
17	initial franchise fee, \$29,500.
18	THE WITNESS: So you're talking about the
19	franchise agreements?
20	JUDGE KWEE: Yes.
21	THE WITNESS: Yeah. It definitely spells out all
22	the services that we provide to them.
23	JUDGE KWEE: Okay.
24	So I guess, when you were just testifying, you
25	had talked about the intangible aspect the services

aspect.

2.4

THE WITNESS: Correct.

JUDGE KWEE: And you had also mentioned the ATM and -- and the training. And is the ATM and the training -- are those also provided as a part of the initial franchisees?

THE WITNESS: It is. And there's, now -- this is a long time ago -- now, we charge a separate \$995 fee for training. I mean, at the time it was included, if memory serves. Yeah. I think it was included.

MR. DAVIS: Your Honor, in the original documents, you had two things. It is -- it runs on the same securities. You have a purchase and sale agreement, which actually has some detail in it. That is the actual Franchise Agreement that has to take a certain format based on that statute.

However, the statute requires the equivalent of a private placement memorandum, and it has all the things in it. The disclosure document -- those go hand in hand, and they reference each other. And the greater detail is in the disclosure document.

THE WITNESS: That's correct. That's correct.

MR. DAVIS: That one goes down to -- if you need to find the licenses, you can find it in, or it's required to be in, the private placement memorandum.

1 That's the equivalent. That's where it touches, 2 in the securities law. It's very, very strict how that has to be done. And it's done on a 50-state basis because 3 4 the U.S. government follows that. 5 Also, that is -- if the state does not have a franchise law, the federal law is used. And that's based 6 on California. 7 The FDD does have a table, your 8 THE WITNESS: Honor, that breaks down all the services and all the fees 9 10 that we charge for them. That's in the franchise 11 disclosure document. 12 If I had a copy, I could tell you which one it 13 is, but it's all in there. 14 JUDGE KWEE: Okay. Thank you. 15 I do have the Franchise Agreement and franchise disclosure document. 16 17 THE WITNESS: Of course. 18 JUDGE KWEE: So -- so I'm just understanding, for 19 the \$\$29,500 initial franchise fee, they'll get the 20 training for \$995 -- a \$995 value, the ATM, which I 21 believe you said a \$\$4,995? THE WITNESS: At the time. It's a lot less now. 2.2 23 Okay. And they'll also get the JUDGE KWEE: 2.4 intangible aspects of the services that -- that you were

25

discussing.

1	So is there anything else?
2	THE WITNESS: The lead generation, the marketing,
3	the compliance. All right?
4	So the reason they joined our business, your
5	Honor there's only one reason, and that's the
6	marketing. Our ability to get their ATM in a Hilton
7	hotel, for example.
8	If they buy it themselves, they could buy it from
9	anywhere for less. The only reason they join us is
10	because we can help them get that in a good location where
11	they can charge a higher surcharge and get more
12	transactions, i.e., make more money. That's the only
13	reason they join us.
14	So we that's a big part of our services. They
15	don't join us to buy ATMs. They don't need us for that.
16	They could conclude that in five minutes over the internet
17	for a lot less money.
18	So, yeah. Sorry.
19	JUDGE KWEE: Okay. I'll turn to the panel.
20	Does the panel have any other questions for this
21	witness?
22	I'll start with Judge Brown.
23	JUDGE BROWN: Thank you.
24	I think I was just going to follow-up and say
25	ask either the witness or the Appellant's Representative,

1 do you want to point us to some specifics about where in 2 the disclosure document does it show that it's never been 3 required for a franchisee to buy the ATM from ACFN? 4 THE WITNESS: Yeah. I can find it. Savs --5 search this thing. So first of all, item 5, you can see where 6 Okay. it clearly identifies the value of the ATM as \$4,995. 7 I just want to point that out it's page 4, item 5. That's 8 right there. That's the value of the machine. The rest 9 10 is all intangible property business know-how. 11 Item 6 lists all of the services that we provide 12 and the fees we charge for them. So that goes back to the 13 other question that I was asked. 14 Okay. Let's see. Items 5 and 7 -- let me see. 15 Numbers 5 and 7 -- I think that's a little --16 Do you have that one? 17 MR. DAVIS: Yeah. Franchise Agreement -- they 18 cross reference each other. They cross reference. 19 And if you go through the footnotes of my opening 20 brief, many of those cites are directly there. And they 21 cross reference each other. And they -- they draw you 22 back to the Exhibit so you can actually go into the 23 Exhibit and find those. 2.4 Also, the --

Sorry.

THE WITNESS: Oh, okay.

25

There's a page 19, item 2, here -- says that we provide you with buying advisory services. We provide you with a list of sources of approved suppliers for ancillary goods services and equipment.

So that's -- there's another place. I could keep looking, but that's just one place right there that tells you. We provide you with lists of sources. You don't have to buy from a particular source. You don't have to buy it from us. You have to buy something that's compliant with our systems. We have to approve it so we can support it.

But again, in some cases, they don't even need equipment because they're buying locations that already have them.

I don't know if you have -- is it possible to send that to the court later so we don't bore them flipping through the heart of pages here? Or is that --

MR. DAVIS: You want those exact cites?

JUDGE KWEE: I'll let Judge Brown respond.

JUDGE BROWN: If -- I guess I want to say that if the if Appellant finds additional citations that we haven't already pointed out, we can accept them after.

But if that is -- if you've already pointed us to them,

23 But if that is -- if you've already pointed us to them,

then that's sufficient.

2.4

THE WITNESS: That's one place. There's another

1 place that's more specific; but -- it's in the franchise 2 agreements. Well, then it's -- I'm 3 JUDGE BROWN: Yeah. 4 I think I found it, actually, in Appellant's sorry. 5 additional brief. 6 Nope. That's not it. Sorry. 7 In Appellant's opening brief --THE WITNESS: So under Equipment Section 2.2 of 8 9 the Franchise Agreement, equipment and other accessories 10 may purchase such equipment from us. 11 Oh, okay. Here. So same thing -- shall purchase or lease such equipment from us or our affiliate at our 12 13 current prices or at our direction from sources and 14 suppliers approved or designated in writing by us. 15 So you can buy from somebody else as long as we 16 approve it. And the only approval is to make sure that 17 it's going to work. 18 MR. DAVIS: Can you clearly cite that again? 19 THE WITNESS: 2.2 -- Section 2.2. It says, 20 "Equipment of the Franchise Agreement." They can buy from 21 other people as long as its compliant with what we do, and 22 we can operate it. 23 I -- I found the page you were JUDGE BROWN: 2.4 reading from. I think that answers my question.

Thank you. No further questions.

25

JUDGE KWEE: Judge Lambert, did you have any questions?

JUDGE LAMBERT: Hey.

2.4

I have a question about if the franchise terminates. And does the ATM not work for the franchisee anymore in that way? And they have to go somewhere else and purchase another franchise to make it work for them again?

THE WITNESS: Great question. So if the agreement expires and they don't renew, they have to either sell the locations with the ATMs or remove them.

Because the ownership of the location rights is with ACFN.

And the -- 99 percent of the time, they either renew or sell the business so they don't lose anything.

So again, the ATMs are not even part of the evaluation, it's what revenue is being generated. If you don't want to continue, we sell that revenue stream to somebody else, and you get your money and you get to go do something else.

MR. DAVIS: Better example than that --

THE WITNESS: If we were to remove our TIE's, what's called from the ATMs, they would some functioning, obviously. But we don't do that. We sell the account to somebody else, and they get the machine with it -- with the purchase; right?

1	FURTHER DIRECT EXAMINATION
2	
3	BY MR. DAVIS:
4	Q In a merger acquisition, what, if any, value is
5	to the ATM and the MNA?
6	A It's the revenue stream. Everything is based on
7	the revenue. But we we just reprogram the machine to
8	work through our network as opposed to the seller's
9	network.
10	Q But the machine itself, actually, doesn't even
11	have scrap value at that point?
12	A No.
13	Q Okay. For accounting purposes
14	A No.
15	Q Because they're they they're not carried at
16	scrap value. Even in the accounting that's required for a
17	franchise, there's special accounting rules for franchise.
18	They carry things on-ledger, off-ledger. They use
19	accounting that applies to banks also.
20	So their equipment is treated differently in a
21	merger acquisition?
22	A Of course. We don't own the machines.
23	MR. DAVIS: Yeah. So but you're selling the
24	territories.
25	JUDGE LAMBERT: Okav. Thanks.

I had one question. Is it, when someone buys a franchise, that equals one ATM? Or can they buy more than one ATM if they have a franchise?

2.4

THE WITNESS: Absolutely. You can buy as many as you want.

There's no reason to buy ten upfront when you don't have locations to put them in. You have to have one to get started. That's why the one was there.

But we did have, back when this audit was happening, exclusive territories. And if somebody wanted that, they'd buy five machines with the franchise thing just to demonstrate that they have the capital to justify an exclusive territory.

We don't do that anymore, but that was part of the agreement at the time. So they could buy one, they could buy five, or they could buy any number. It's based on how big they want to grow.

And we don't recommend buying more than one. When that goes in, you buy the next one. Because it's all about finding new locations and generating income.

Again, if you have ten machines, you're just taking up space in your garage. There's no value there. You buy one. When it goes in, get the next one. That goes in, get the next one. That's how we run the business.

1 JUDGE LAMBERT: Thank you.

2.4

THE WITNESS: Maybe I should -- perhaps I should note -- maybe it was part of your question -- the revenue we generate from ATM sales is -- I looked at 2019 before we came here because that's the last normal year, 2019 was -- 3.75 percent of our revenue was from ATM sales.

It's really not -- 90 percent was transaction revenue. There was some franchise fees in there.

3.75 percent was equipment sales. That's really a tiny part of what we do. That's not what people come to us for.

JUDGE KWEE: This is Judge Kwee.

I did have a follow-up question on Judge Brown's line of questioning.

So did you -- during the audit period at issue, did you have franchisees who would come, prospective franchisees, and say that we'd want to sign up, but we want to use our own ATM machines, so we don't want to receive any ATM from you?

THE WITNESS: So that's rare. They would have to already be in the business to have their own equipment.

So that was rare. I don't know if that happened during the audit period.

What did happen, definitely, during the audit period is we had acquisitions where we bought accounts

1	from competitors, and their ATMs that were originally
2	purchased by the competitors not through ACFN, not by a
3	franchisee, by the competitor transferred into our
4	network to the franchisee that bought those locations.
5	That definitely happened during that period of
6	time.
7	JUDGE KWEE: Okay. So I guess I was
8	contemplating the initial scenario, when they first become
9	a franchisee.
10	THE WITNESS: Sure.
11	JUDGE KWEE: And if someone did do that, is the
12	fee still "nineteen-five"? Or do you reduce it? Would
13	you have reduced it?
14	THE WITNESS: If they really did not need a
15	machine, we would take that part off the price.
16	JUDGE KWEE: Okay.
17	THE WITNESS: But even if they're buying
18	locations with existing machines, if they want to grow,
19	they still need one to grow with.
20	But if they really didn't need one or want one,
21	of course we take it off. They're not getting that value;
22	so we take it off.
23	JUDGE KWEE: Okay. Thank you.
24	THE WITNESS: But it wouldn't be free it. Would

be \$4,995 off.

25

1	JUDGE KWEE: Okay.
2	THE WITNESS: So the machines not \$29,500,
3	anyway.
4	JUDGE KWEE: Thank you.
5	THE WITNESS: Yeah.
6	JUDGE KWEE: Are there any other questions from
7	the Panel?
8	JUDGE BROWN: No further questions. Thank you.
9	JUDGE KWEE: Okay. And for Appellant's
10	representative, did you have any follow-up questions for
11	your witness? Before I move to
12	MR. DAVIS: No redirect, your Honor. You allowed
13	me redirect at the time; so I'm fine.
14	JUDGE KWEE: Okay. Great.
15	I did have one question for CDTFA.
16	I believe in in your opening presentation, you
17	were referring to the, you know, the Dell case and
18	Regulation 1501, which I believe has to do with the
19	provision of services and the true object of the contract.
20	Can but I believe what they were saying is
21	that there's also intangible aspects transferred. And I'm
22	not sure that Regulation 1501 applies if you're having
23	intangible aspects intangible aspects together.
24	I'm not sure if you have a response to that or if
25	that would change, at all, the analysis that you have

1	talked about.
2	MR. BACCHUS: So 15 Regulation 1501 does apply
3	to services.
4	Based on Mr. Kerr's testimony, it would appear
5	that most of that fee is constitutes services. So we
6	would the Department believes that the franchise fee
7	constitutes services; so 1501 would apply.
8	JUDGE KWEE: Okay. Thank you.
9	And for the panel, just any questions for
10	CDTFA before we move on to closing?
11	JUDGE BROWN: No questions. Thank you.
12	JUDGE KWEE: Okay.
13	And, Judge Lambert, do you have any questions?
14	JUDGE LAMBERT: Not at this time. Thanks.
15	JUDGE KWEE: Okay.
16	So then I will turn it over to Appellants for
17	their final closings before you have ten minutes.
18	
19	CLOSING ARGUMENT
20	
21	MR. DAVIS: Thank you.
22	California's Franchise Investment Law defines a
23	franchise as a contract. Okay? It's granted the right to
24	engage in a business, offering, selling, and distributing
25	services under a plan or a system substantial

prescribed in substantial part by the franchisor associated with the franchisor's trademarks, commercial marks, symbols. And they're required by statute to pay a franchise fee.

2.4

The California Corporations Code requires registration of all franchise offerings. And key requirement that registration is that the franchise fee be paid directly to the franchisor by the franchisee in exchange for the right -- the right to engage in a proprietary business and to use certain intellectual property rights in a defined field of use.

It's designed -- the whole thing is about the license. It's a license. It's an intangible. That's what the entire statute is saying -- it's the purpose.

And if you look at the history of how the statute is put together, everything there is an intangible except for the ATM, which is a tool. And each individual franchisee pays tax on that.

As we said, there are alternatives, and it's not required that you actually buy it. In both documents, whether it be the Franchise Agreement as expounded on by the Disclosure Document and Disclosure Document, is put together in the fashion and separates things out in the fashion that California's statute and regulations require.

You can see that the majority of what is -- what

is -- what is transferred to the franchisee under the statute -- the Franchise Statute is intangible. It is geared around intellectual property and rights. And each one of those intellectual property rights -- even the patent rights and other trade secret mark rights -- they have separate agreements that roll up.

Those are defined. And tell you which ones you have to participate in for the FDIC. So there's really no choice there. These licenses have to be separately stayed out.

Everything there, except for the ATM and the sub-equipment that goes with the ATM, which is a cash drawer. Everything's intangible, and all the services stand on their own. They're separately defined. They stand on their own.

So as logic looks at that Franchise Agreement and that license, that license predominantly -- other than if we're looking at it by value -- 3 percent of its total value is a value -- even in its -- its -- its internal rate of return, et cetera, no matter how you look at it -- is less than 3 percent.

So is that 3 percent -- is the tail wagging the dog not logical? That's not a logical reading of that statute, and it's not handled that way in 50 states. And they're using our statute, California. We set the tone

for this nationwide. And this is -- this goes against logic.

2.4

We've been fighting this for eight years. We're trying to tell people we don't sell ATMs. There are alternatives. We cited them out, and you've even asked questions. It's the first time anybody's bothered to read this.

If you go through and read Exhibit 8, Exhibit 8 has two letters in it. And it will tell you how badly misread these two documents were and how that's carried through as -- as -- as -- as the -- the mantra from the State all the way through this misreading of what's actually in these two documents -- those two letters back and forth between us documenting what happened with the auditors.

The auditors finally came around. They actually helped us file the claims for refund because they understood what was going on, finally. They sat down.

The -- the -- the document that set out the example that we sat here and went through, Exhibit 9 -- the auditors -- they got it finally.

But those were very badly misread. And those two letters that I quote from and the Exhibit that has the two letters with the back-and-forth documenting what we described with the State -- you'll see exactly where the

1 rails went off -- where the train went off the rails from
2 the very beginning.

2.4

And it happened in the audit reports, which was just taking a company line, and followed all the way through the facts. And -- and -- and the distinction defies logic.

So those -- the -- the four exhibits -- the four exhibits that I would point you to that -- that speaks directly to these documents and your questions are as follows:

Exhibits 5 and 6 -- the -- the franchise -- the Franchise Agreement and the Disclosure Document.

Franchise 9 -- I mean, article -- Exhibit 9, which --

which is the exhibit that deals with the example. Exhibit B --

JUDGE LAMBERT: Could you -- could you please speak in the microphone.

MR. DAVIS: Excuse me.

JUDGE LAMBERT: I'm hearing we're not hearing you speak on the stream.

MR. DAVIS: Attachment B to Exhibit 9.

And the other one is Exhibit 8. And Exhibit 8 has the two audit discussion letters right after the audit reports with the San Jose auditors.

So there's Exhibit 8, Exhibit 9, Exhibit 5,

Exhibit 6 -- that's where the heart of this testimony came from or was based upon.

And with that, I close.

JUDGE KWEE: Okay. Thank you.

So I will turn it over to CDTFA. You have ten minutes for your closing presentation. Thank you.

MR. BACCHUS: Thank you.

## CLOSING ARGUMENT

2.4

MR. BACCHUS: The -- the Department just would like to reiterate that we are looking at specific transactions. The transactions are described in the Franchise Agreement and the Disclosure Document.

And it is clear in those documents that for a -for a contract amount, the franchise fee of \$\$29,500, that
includes a transfer of an ATM and a cash cassette.

Transfers of tangible personal property, like an ATM,
constitute a sale of tangible personal property. That
sale is subject to sales tax. And included in that amount
are any services that are a part of the sale of the
transfer of tangible personal property.

There had been no -- there is no evidence. And, in fact, Mr. Kerr's testimony supports the fact that these services are mandatory and not optional. Mandatory

services that are part of the sale of tangible personal property are subject to tax. And that is supported by the evidence that Appellant has submitted.

And there is no evidence that the -- that the services were somehow an optional part of the transfer of the ATM.

The testimony today was that you could not get the ATM without also paying for the services. So that constitutes a bundled transaction.

And as -- as the Department has said and continues to state, in those types of transactions, services that are part of that sale, or part of the transfer of the TPP, the tangible personal property, are taxable.

Thank you.

2.4

JUDGE KWEE: Thank you.

Just bear with me one moment.

Do the panel members have any questions? Before I --

Do you -- do you mind if I just get a quick clarification from the witness about a testimony that was provided today?

Okay. So was there testimony that it would not be possible to purchase an ATM without the franchise fee also? Just, I believe, CDTFA had mentioned that was

1 stated today. I just wanted to clarify whether or not 2. that was stated. 3 THE WITNESS: We don't sell ATMs to anybody that's not a franchisee. You have to be a franchisee, 4 5 first. 6 JUDGE KWEE: Okay. Thank you for that 7 clarification. I believe we're ready to conclude today. 8 9 So the panel -- are there any more questions from 10 the panel? 11 Thank you. Thank you for coming in today. We're ready to close the record for this Appeal. 12 13 The record is now closed. This is submitted Wednesday 14 July 20th, 2022. 15 We will have a decision issued within a hundred 16 So after today, the Judges will meet and discuss 17 this case. And we'll send you a written opinion of our 18 decision in the mail. So this concludes the oral hearing for this 19 20 hearing, but there will another hearing shortly at 21 approximately 11:00 a.m. or sooner. 22 Thank you. 23 MR. BACCHUS: Thank you. 2.4 (Proceedings concluded at 10:47 a.m.)

25

## 1 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION 2 I, the undersigned, a Registered 3 4 Professional Reporter of the State of California, do 5 hereby certify: That the foregoing proceedings were taken before 6 7 me at the time and place herein set forth; that any witnesses in the foregoing proceedings, prior to 8 testifying, were duly sworn; that a record of the 9 10 proceedings was made by me using machine shorthand, which was thereafter transcribed under my direction; that the 11 foregoing transcript is a true record of the testimony 12 13 given. 14 Further, that if the foregoing pertains to the 15 original transcript of a deposition in a federal case, before completion of the proceedings, review of the 16 transcript [] was [x] was not requested. 17 18 I further certify I am neither financially 19 interested in the action nor a relative or employee of any 20 attorney or party to this action. IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have this date subscribed 21

23 Dated: August 8, 2022

my name.

Sarah Tuman

25

2.4

22

Index: \$\$29,500..agreement

\$	<b>2.2</b> 45:8,19	<b>6091</b> 15:24	accurate 9:7,25
<u> </u>	<b>20</b> 2:18 4:17 5:1	7	<b>ACFN</b> 2:6 5:6 6:10,13 10:16,19
<b>\$\$29,500</b> 15:5,9	<b>2003</b> 20:15		12:4,9 20:12 21:2
30:3 41:19 57:16	<b>2019</b> 7:1 49:4,5	<b>7</b> 43:14,15	22:24 23:2,17
<b>\$\$4,995</b> 15:9 30:4 41:21	<b>2020</b> 7:4		24:12,19 27:3 28:10 30:11,20
<b>\$196,000</b> 15:21	<b>2022</b> 2:18 5:1,9 59:14	8	31:2 32:21 37:19 43:3 46:12 50:2
<b>\$29,500</b> 29:21 39:17 51:2	<b>20th</b> 5:9 59:14	<b>8</b> 4:4,5 55:8 56:22, 25	<b>ACFN's</b> 11:15 12:1 29:13
<b>\$350</b> 18:10	<b>25</b> 9:23		
<b>\$4,995</b> 29:22 37:2	<b>299</b> 29:21	9	acquire 16:15
43:7 50:25		<b>9</b> 35:13,14,18,20	acquired 24:7
<b>\$995</b> 40:8 41:20	3	55:20 56:13,21,25	acquiring 17:20
	<b>3</b> 54:18,21,22	<b>90</b> 49:7	acquisition 47:4 21
1	<b>3.75</b> 49:6,9	<b>99</b> 46:13	acquisitions
<b>1</b> 8:7,17 21:22	<b>330.3330</b> 18:5	<b>9:35</b> 2:17 5:2,10	23:25 49:25
<b>1-11</b> 4:4 8:20		<b>9:50</b> 10:9	act 12:10
<b>10</b> 4:12 7:1 9:20	4	<b>9th</b> 7:4	actual 38:2 40:14
<b>10:47</b> 2:18 59:24	<b>4</b> 43:8		<b>ad</b> 26:23
<b>11</b> 7:2,8,9,13,18	<b>400</b> 2:16	A	additional 15:11
8:7,17	<b>47</b> 4:18	<b>A-C</b> 4:5 8:22	18:6 44:21 45:5
<b>11:00</b> 59:21		<b>a.m.</b> 2:17,18 5:2,	ADMINISTRATION 3:10
<b>11th</b> 7:11	5	10 59:21,24	
<b>14</b> 4:13		ability 14:7 42:6	<b>Administrative</b> 5:14,16 8:21,23
<b>14-day</b> 23:10	<b>5</b> 15:3 23:6 43:6,8, 14,15 56:11,25	absolute 38:10	20:3
<b>15</b> 9:21 52:2	<b>50</b> 54:24	absolutely 22:15	admission 8:11
<b>1501</b> 16:8 51:18,	<b>50-state</b> 41:3	23:23 32:9,24	admitted 8:18
22 52:2,7	<b>52</b> 4:22	33:2,17,19 34:5 36:18 48:4	adopted 13:10
<b>18124128</b> 2:6 5:8	<b>57</b> 4:23	accept 44:22	advisory 44:2
<b>19</b> 7:6 44:1	31 4.23	access 28:4	affiliate 45:12
<b>1969</b> 12:25 18:9	6	accessories 45:9	agency 6:2
<b>1972</b> 13:10	<b>6</b> 15:18 43:11	account 10:21	aggregates
	56:11 57:1	29:3 46:23	20:22
2	<b>6011</b> 16:5	accounting	aggregating 38:
<b>2</b> 44:1	<b>6012</b> 16:1,5	21:21 47:13,16, 17,19	<b>agree</b> 9:14
<b>2,000</b> 31:13	<b>6051</b> 15:22	accounts 49:25	agreement 13:12 13 15:4,10 17:18, 21 22:17 24:13

Index: agreements..brings

29:22 30:3 33:11, 12 35:1,8 36:23 38:24 39:14 40:13,15 41:15 43:17 45:9,20 46:10 48:15 53:21 54:16 56:12 57:14 agreements 31:17 39:19 45:2 54:6 ALJ 3:3,5

**allocated** 9:20, 21,23 19:7

**allowed** 12:17 51:12

**alternative** 24:13, 18 38:14

alternatives 53:19 55:5

**amount** 15:4,9,16 16:2,6 17:18 18:1 57:16,20

analog 14:5

analysis 51:25

**ancillary** 22:3 44:3

**Andrew** 3:3 5:15

annotation 18:5,

answers 45:24

anybody's 55:6

**anymore** 46:6 48:14

apologies 7:16

apologize 11:11

**appeal** 2:5 5:6,24 8:2 9:11,16 14:23 18:13 19:13,16 25:20 59:12

**Appeals** 2:1 5:8 10:6

APPEARANCES

3:1

**Appellant** 2:7 3:7 6:7 8:7,15,18,25 9:1,7 15:1,5,13 17:3,4,16,19 18:16 20:2 44:21 58:3

**appellant's** 4:4, 15 6:25 8:20 9:20 10:7 15:3,17,18 18:18 19:18 35:18 42:25 45:4,7 51:9

Appellants 52:16 application 18:22

**applies** 47:19 51:22

**apply** 19:1 52:2,7

approval 45:16

**approve** 44:10 45:16

**approved** 24:14, 15,18 26:1 38:15 44:3 45:14

approximately 5:10 59:21

April 7:1

area 33:24

argument 4:20 17:9 52:19 57:9

article 56:13

aspect 39:25 40:1

**aspects** 41:24 51:21,23

assumption 22:25

**ATM** 9:11,14,17 10:18,19,20 11:19,24,25 13:17,23 14:7,24 15:2,6,10 16:24, 25 17:1,5,6 18:14 22:8,24 23:1,2,3, 5,12,13,15,17 24:3,4,8 25:6,7, 11,22 26:13 27:1,

5,19 28:6,8,9 29:13,14,16,22 30:3,13 31:2,3,7,9 37:15,17 40:3,4 41:20 42:6 43:3,7 46:5 47:5 48:2,3 49:4,6,18,19 53:17 54:11,12 57:17,18 58:6,8,

**ATM's** 11:18

**ATMS** 9:13 12:2, 21 14:25 15:11,16 17:9,17,20,22,25 19:10,14 23:21 24:1 29:17 31:12 42:15 46:11,15,22 50:1 55:4 59:3

attachment 35:15,16,20,21 56:21

attachments 35:15

attendance 6:5 attention 35:14

attorney 12:25 13:2,3 30:2

**audit** 9:16 11:13 15:14 27:17 30:14 31:20 48:9 49:15, 23,24 56:3,23

**auditors** 55:15, 16,20 56:24

automated 14:24

В

**Bacchus** 3:12 4:13,23 6:3 8:13 9:5 14:22 39:10 52:2 57:7,11 59:23

**back** 7:7 14:16 19:18 43:12,22 48:9 55:13

back-and-forth

55:24

backup 18:8

**badly** 55:9,22

**bank** 13:21,25 14:9,12 21:7 31:21

**banking** 11:18 15:8 17:2,6 21:9 34:3

**banks** 14:3 47:19

based 11:13 12:13 19:15 21:23 24:2,5 33:4,20 38:12 40:16 41:6 47:6 48:16 52:4 57:2

**basis** 41:3

bear 58:17

**begin** 10:8 14:14, 18

**beginning** 21:14 28:25 56:2

behalf 20:2

believes 52:6

benefit 17:7

**big** 42:14 48:17

**bit** 11:2

Board 29:4

**boards** 25:24

bookkeeping 32:2

**bore** 44:16

bothered 55:6

**bought** 49:25 50:4

breaks 41:9

briefing 18:16

**bring** 32:2

brings 7:11

Index: Brown..considered

**Brown** 3:5 5:17 called 13:13 20:2 **check** 7:20 company 20:22 42:22,23 44:19,20 46:22 56:4 checking 10:21 45:3,23 51:8 calls 22:22 25:6 competitor 50:3 52:11 choice 54:9 capital 48:12 competitors **Brown's** 49:13 circuit 11:20 26:6, 50:1,2 card 13:20 14:9 **build** 32:1 complete 23:11 carried 47:15 Cirrus 21:6 **bunch** 21:8 34:19 55:10 citations 44:21 bundle 19:1 compliance carry 47:18 cite 45:18 21:21 22:20 **bundled** 19:5,12 31:18,25 32:10 case 5:8 18:17 34:17 36:12 58:9 **cited** 55:5 31:12 51:17 59:17 34:10 35:8 42:3 business 10:17, cites 43:20 44:18 cases 16:11 44:12 compliant 22:10 19,23 11:16,18 44:10 45:21 **City** 18:18 12:1,10,21 17:2,3 **cash** 15:6,11 21:18 22:2,8 25:23 36:9 54:12 **claims** 55:17 comply 21:8 23:15 24:8 29:14, 57:17 24:15 Claremon 3:11 17,18,24 32:18,19 cassette 15:7 components 6:4 37:6 39:4 42:4 57:17 26:1 43:10 46:14 48:25 clarification 49:21 52:24 53:10 cassettes 15:12 58:21 59:7 computations 32:4 button 6:18 **CDTFA** 6:2 8:12, clarify 39:13 59:1 18 9:4 14:15,18 computer 25:23 **buy** 22:23 23:1,3, clear 16:20 30:20 39:8,9 51:15 5,8,12,16,17,18, concerns 10:1 57:15 52:10 57:5 58:25 21 24:11,13,18 conclude 23:6 close 57:3 59:12 31:2,3,9 38:6,13, **CDTFA's** 8:3 9:21 42:16 59:8 14,17 42:8,15 **closed** 59:13 **Cell** 25:13 43:3 44:8,9 45:15, concluded 15:15 closer 11:2 20 48:2,4,6,11,15, **CEO** 6:11,12 9:1 59:24 16,19,23 53:20 20:13 closing 4:20 9:24 concludes 59:19 52:10,19 57:6,9 **buying** 23:25 **cetera** 27:18 concluding 2:17 24:1.2 44:2.13 54:20 closings 52:17 48:18 50:17 conclusion 29:23 Chad 3:12 6:3 **cloud** 28:2 30:5 buys 48:1 chain 37:24 code 13:5 15:22 conduct 12:10 33:21 53:5 **change** 30:17 17:2,5 C 51:25 collaborate conducted 5:11 31:16 calculate 15:20 changed 30:14 conducting 5:21 commencing calculation 9:14 channel 5:12 conference 6:25 2:17 13:19,24 14:8 California 2:2,16, 7:4 8:4,6,9 commercial 53:2 20 3:9 5:1.11 **charge** 29:21 configuration 10:17 13:3 15:1 31:8,14 40:8 communicate 22:6 41:10 42:11 43:12 41:7 53:5 54:25 13:21,25 14:4,9 confirm 7:7 California's charges 12:9 communication connection 26:3 13:10 52:22 53:24 18:21,22,23,25 26:20 considered charging 25:13 call 23:2 25:24 companies 9:1 20:16 32:23 26:17,18 29:16 31:3

determined 24:6 consist 8:3 29:2,3,9 31:22,23 56:18,21 32:12,21 33:13,22 consistent 18:1 days 59:16 determining 34:16 36:10,11, 16:16 consisting 7:2 15,21 37:2,12,16, dealing 13:5 18 38:20 40:2,22 develop 27:9 constitute 16:21 deals 56:14 cost 15:10 16:3,4 device 26:5,6,20 19:12 57:19 debit 12:20 24:4 34:10 devices 25:11 constitutes 52:5, debits 34:20 costly 34:1 7 58:9 differently 47:20 decide 5:23 12:7 counsel 22:20 consumed 12:3 digital 14:5 33:23 decision 21:23 consumer 10:20 digitized 14:5 59:15,18 counter 25:14 12:19 16:12 decisions 11:14 direct 4:16 20:9 contained 7:6 **County** 18:17,18 28:20 47:1 37:18,19 contemplating **couple** 39:12 declined 34:25 directing 35:16 50:8 **court** 18:16,17 deduction 16:2 direction 45:13 continue 46:17 44:16 defies 56:6 directional 11:9 **covers** 12:12 continues 58:11 defined 53:11 directly 7:25 **contract** 15:4,9, create 13:4 54:7.14 10:22 29:5 35:12 16 16:14 17:18,25 created 12:22 43:20 53:8 56:9 18:21 51:19 52:23 defines 16:1 57:16 **credit** 12:19 disclosure 15:17 52:22 22:16 23:9 26:24 contracts 17:10 credit/debit delineated 33:7 33:3,8,20 38:12 24:23 25:19 10:20 **Dell** 18:17,19,20 40:19,21 41:11,16 convenience credits 34:20 43:2 53:22 56:12 19:1,4,12 51:17 29:14 38:8 57:14 cross 4:16 43:18. demonstrate conversations 48:12 **discuss** 59:16 21 21:24 current 45:13 **denied** 19:16 discussed 8:4,8 conversion 33:8 34:3 customer 39:14 Department 3:10 31:15 discussing 27:14 15:15,19 18:2 customers 25:20 **Cool** 8:1 19:15 52:6 57:11 41.25 58:10 coordinate 7:10 discussion 56:23 D department's 4:5 coordinating **dispute** 16:23 8:22 15:14 17:16 19:9 29:8, 7:12 **date** 5:9 19 31:24 dependent 18:23 **copy** 35:18 41:12 **dates** 7:16 Depends 32:14 disputes 24:17 core 10:22 12:20 **Davis** 3:7 4:12,22 **distinct** 34:5,15 designated 45:14 6:10 7:9,15,24 corporation 15:1 35:3 36:8 8:16 9:8 10:3,11, 18:7 designed 32:20 15,24 11:5,8,13 distinction 56:5 33:12,15 53:12 Corporations 19:20 20:11 distinctions 53:5 detail 12:7 13:14 35:21,23 36:1 23:19 33:21 39:16 39:5 40:11,23 **correct** 8:12,15 40:14,20 43:17 44:18 45:18 distribute 7:18 9:4 21:3,13 24:10, 46:20 47:3,23 24,25 25:8 26:4,7, **details** 13:13 distributed 8:5,8 51:12 52:21 9,15 28:18,23 35:10

Index: distributing..franchise

distributing environment 21,22,25 57:1 17:20,22,24 18:3 52:24 31:13 19:13 22:18 31:14 exhibits 4:4,5 7:2, 34:10 35:7 41:9 distributor 38:4 equal 5:20 6,8,9,18 8:2,3,7, 43:12 49:8 10,17 56:7,8,11 document 15:17 **Equalization** field 20:16 53:11 22:16 26:24 33:4, 29:4 existing 50:18 9,20 38:12 40:19, fighting 55:3 equals 48:2 expect 22:1 21 41:11,16 43:2 file 22:17 55:17 53:22 55:19 56:12 equipment 15:12 expense 16:4 final 52:17 57:14 18:11 21:23 24:9 expires 46:10 37:25 38:13 44:4, documenting **finally** 55:16,18, 13 45:8,9,10,12, explain 32:1 55:14.24 21 20 47:20 49:9,21 expounded documents financial 11:16 equivalent 40:17 53:21 40:12 53:20 12:20 15:7 24:21 41:1 55:10,13 56:9 expressly 18:24 34:3,21 57:15 errata 7:10 find 23:2 31:5 **extra** 15:6 dog 54:23 estimates 9:19 40:24 43:4,23 10:1,2 double 7:20 F **finding** 48:20 evaluation 46:16 draw 35:13 43:21 finds 44:21 facilitate 23:13 **Everything's drawer** 54:13 fine 10:3 51:13 54:13 facilitating 38:6 drop-ship 28:16 fit 24:16 25:16 **evidence** 8:21,23 fact 13:9 17:21 38:18 duly 20:3 10:16 11:21 14:13 30:6 35:11 36:23 17:19 57:23 58:3, fits 38:15 37:3 57:24 dumb 11:20 flipping 44:17 facts 17:8 56:5 evidentiary 8:19 Ε flows 36:10 factually 24:12 exact 44:18 focus 31:10 fashion 12:5 earlier 36:22 **EXAMINATION** 53:23,24 follow 28:24 20:9 47:1 early 28:21 **FCC** 13:8 **follow-up** 42:24 examined 20:4 earn 22:1 49:13 51:10 **FDD** 23:9 41:8 exchange 12:17 economically footnotes 43:19 **FDIC** 10:22 11:17 39:16 53:9 34:9 14:1 21:5 54:8 Force 27:24 exclusive 48:10, **Edward** 3:7 6:10 federal 41:6 13 foregoing 19:15 email 8:5 federally 12:19 exclusively **format** 40:15 end 13:20 36:9 15:13 fee 3:10 12:9,17 forms 15:7 engage 52:24 18:6,10,14 19:11 excruciating forward 30:15 53:9 23:11 29:20,24 33:21 30:4 39:17 40:8 found 15:14,17 ensure 5:22 **excuse** 30:23 41:19 50:12 52:5, 45:4,23 56:18 entail 13:14,15 6 53:4,7 57:16 founder 6:12 58:24 exhibit 7:2 8:20, entered 17:17 22 15:3,14,18 franchise 9:12. feedback 10:25 entire 13:5 15:16 35:9,13,14,18,19, 15,17 10:17 12:3, 17:25 53:14 fees 9:12,15,17 20 43:22.23 55:8. 9,11,12,22 13:13 14:24 15:15,20 20,23 56:13,14, 14:24 15:2,4,6,10,

Index: Franchised..initial

handed 11:14 **hotels** 31:13 15,20 17:4,7,18, G 19,21,22,24 18:3, handing 35:18,23 hundred 59:15 6,10,12,14,15 19:11,13 21:11,15 handled 18:2 hundreds 29:16 gain 18:11 22:12,15,16 54:24 31:3 garage 48:22 23:11,18,21 happen 11:24 Hyosung 22:5 29:15,20,24 30:4, geared 54:3 12:2 23:22,23 12,18 33:11,14 49:24 General 12:25 36:23 37:5 38:21, ı 22,24 39:17,19 happened 49:22 **General's** 13:2,3 40:15 41:6,10,15, 50:5 55:14 56:3 **i.e.** 42:12 generate 29:15 19 43:17 45:1,9, happening 48:10 identifies 29:22 49:4 20 46:4,7 47:17 43:7 48:2,3,11 49:8 hear 10:25 11:5 generated 22:1 52:6,22,23 53:4,6, 24:3,5 46:16 important 22:23 **heard** 5:13 7,21 54:2,16 31:19 generates 22:9 56:11,12,13 hearing 2:19 **imposes** 15:22 57:14,16 58:24 5:10,13,19,21 7:3 generating 30:25 9:2 56:19 59:19, Franchised 2:6 32:10 48:20 inapplicable 19:13 5:7 generation 27:18 **heart** 30:25 32:9 42:2 incidental 16:19, franchisee 12:18 44:17 57:1 20,25 17:9,12 18:10,11,14 21:12 Genmega 22:5 26:19 28:20 38:13 43:3 **held** 5:7 46:5 50:3,4,9 **good** 7:19 10:15 incidentally **helped** 11:12 53:8,18 54:1 59:4 14:22 23:14 42:10 16:13 55:17 franchisees 12:6 **goods** 44:4 include 30:11 **Hey** 46:3 15:3,11,18 17:6 Google 23:1 included 9:15 18:8 19:9 21:22 higher 31:5,14,15 government 13:9 16:23 30:23,24 23:4,14 25:18 42:11 32:16 40:9,10 27:21 28:25 31:15 41:4 Hilton 42:6 38:5 40:6 49:16, 57:20 granted 12:18 17 hire 32:13 includes 16:6 52:23 57:17 franchises 13:5,6 historical 12:13 Great 9:9 10:4 franchisor 22:18 46:9 51:14 including 17:13 historically 12:14 30:7 53:1,8 18:2 greater 40:20 **income** 22:1,9 franchisor's 53:2 24:2 29:16 48:20 history 36:24 green 7:22,24 53:15 Francisco 18:18 incorrect 24:12 gross 15:25 16:1 holder 14:9 free 50:24 Independent grow 48:17 50:18, 20:19,21 holding 9:1 fully 12:3 19 individual 10:20 holds 18:19 function 27:7 quess 39:24 24:22 36:6 53:17 44:20 50:7 35:5 Honor 7:16 8:16 industry 21:9 39:6 40:11 41:9 functioning 42:5 51:12 information 5:23 46:22 Н **hoping** 39:13 fundamental **initial** 9:12 18:5 **hand** 19:23 35:17 11:15 30:24 39:16,17 hospitality 31:12 40:19 40:6 41:19 50:8 hotel 42:7

**inside** 11:25 items 9:15 43:14 **Kerr's** 52:4 57:24 **letter** 18:8 35:14, 13:22 25:22 19 key 53:6 install 12:4 27:21 J **letters** 55:9,13,23, kidding 11:8 28:12 30:21 32:8. 24 56:23 12 37:21 kind 22:1 32:5 January 7:4 level 25:4 instructed 29:1 know-how 21:18 Jason 3:12 6:5 liability 15:19 29:24 37:6 43:10 intangible 12:14, **Jeff** 6:11 35:24 **license** 12:18 17 21:19 29:20,25 **Kwee** 3:3 5:4,15 15:5 17:4 22:14 **Jeffery** 4:17 20:1 30:5 36:20,24 6:6,14,17,21 7:14, 53:13 54:17 37:5 39:25 41:24 17 8:1,14,17,24 **Jeffrey** 6:12 8:25 43:10 51:21.23 licensed 22:18 9:6,9 10:4,24 join 24:8 42:9,13, 53:13,16 54:2,13 30:6 36:19 11:6,10 14:15 15 19:17,21 20:7 intangibles 36:15 licenses 12:12, 35:20,22 39:7,11, joined 42:4 15,16 13:14 15:2 integrated 17:22 20,23 40:3 41:14, 21:10 24:22 32:2 joining 22:2 18,23 42:19 44:19 intellectual 40:24 54:9 46:1 49:12 50:7, **Jose** 56:24 13:15,16 32:25 11,16,23 51:1,4,6, **lies** 37:14,15 53:10 54:3,4 Josh 3:5 5:17 9,14 52:8,12,15 light 6:18 7:22,24 intended 25:24 57:4 58:16 59:6 journal 31:24 light's 6:16 interact 14:8 **Judge** 5:4,16,21 L **limited** 11:9 34:20 6:6,14,17,21 7:14, internal 54:20 17 8:1,14,17,21, list 7:2 15:20 44:3 internet 14:10,11 **labor** 16:4 23,24 9:6,9 10:4, 26:3,9 42:16 lists 15:18 43:11 24 11:6,10 14:15 laid 39:15 44:7 19:17,21 20:3,7 interrupt 10:25 Lambert 3:5 5:17 35:20,22 39:7,11, livestream 7:22 interrupted 46:1,3 47:25 49:1 20,23 40:3 41:14, 11:1,3 20:20,24 52:13,14 56:16,19 18,23 42:19,22,23 livestreamed 44:19,20 45:3,23 Investment 52:22 language 14:4 5:12 46:1,3 47:25 49:1, **involve** 17:10 12,13 50:7,11,16, laptop 28:3 load 27:11 23 51:1,4,6,8,9,14 involved 18:21 **law** 5:14,15,16 loaded 26:25 28:8 52:8,11,12,13,14, 8:21,23 20:3 41:2, involves 16:17 15 56:16.19 57:4 loads 37:19 6 52:22 58:16 59:6 involving 18:3 location 14:12 Layman's 30:1 Judges 5:14 **ISO** 20:18,21,25 17:5 22:9 31:7 59:16 lead 3:3 5:15 13:4 21:1,2,4 42:10 46:12 27:15,17 42:2 July 2:18 5:1,9 **issue** 9:10,11,16, locations 24:1,3, leads 27:20,25 59:14 17 14:23 16:23 7 27:21 31:6.16 30:25 32:10 17:10 18:13 19:2 justify 48:12 32:4 44:13 46:11 22:21 28:21 29:13 leap 30:8 48:7,20 50:4,18 49:15 **logic** 54:16 55:2 K lease 45:12 **issued** 59:15 56:6 leased 18:7 keeping 31:23 issues 13:1 35:12 logical 36:22 **left** 5:17 54:23 **Kerr** 3:8 4:17 6:11, item 43:6,8,11 **legal** 12:9,11,18 12,15,16,20 8:25 44:1 Logically 36:24 9:3 19:23 20:1.12

Index: long..operate

long 20:14 40:8 32:10 42:2,6 mixed 7:16 18:20 normal 49:5 45:15,21 marks 53:3 MNA 47:5 **Nos** 8:20,22 looked 49:4 Mastercard **model** 10:18 note 7:2 49:3 lose 46:14 31:20 13:10 29:18 37:6 **noted** 35:9 lot 11:10,12 22:19 materials 16:3 models 27:6 noticed 6:24 23:22 41:22 42:17 matter 2:5 5:7 moment 58:17 Nowadays 25:10 **lump** 19:7 6:23 13:9 35:11 money 42:12,17 54:20 number 5:8 48:16 46:18 M Meaning 14:3 **Numbers** 43:15 months 7:4 means 11:17 37:4 **morning** 10:15 machine 14:24 0 mechanism 17:1 14:22 22:2 23:12,17 31:23 43:9 46:24 meet 5:19 59:16 move 11:1 51:11 **object** 16:14 47:7,10 50:15 52:10 51:19 meets 33:15 machines 18:7 moved 25:10 objections 8:10 member 13:20 23:14,16 24:6,12 9:2 **moving** 30:15 25:14 27:22 47:22 members 3:5 48:11,21 49:18 **obtain** 17:25 5:18 10:15 34:23 multiple 24:2 50:18 51:2 18:14 24:23 58:18 made 24:11 obtained 21:12 memorandum Ν 40:18,25 mail 59:18 **OEM** 37:24 names 6:1 memory 40:9 mainframe 14:4 off-ledger 47:18 national 21:6 mention 11:11 majority 53:25 offer 12:19 34:21, 34:23 25 mentioned 40:3 make 12:4,6 22:23 nationwide 55:1 58:25 30:8,14 37:18 offered 8:10 39:3 42:12 45:16 nauseam 26:23 12:24 29:14 merger 47:4,21 46:7 Nautilus 22:4 offering 52:24 **mic** 11:9 makes 26:17,18 offerings 53:6 needed 5:23 microphone 6:15 mandatory 7:21 11:2 56:17 network 11:23 **Office** 2:1 5:8 17:14,24 19:2,11 24:16,24 25:3,4, 10:6 microphones 57:25 25 32:1 33:5 34:2 7:25 Officially 38:4 mantra 55:11 35:7 37:12,14 mind 58:20 38:15,19 47:8,9 on-ledger 47:18 manual 32:15,20 50:4 minutes 9:20,21, open 14:8 29:3 manufacture 23,24 10:9 23:6 networks 21:6 28:10 opening 5:6 9:20, 42:16 52:17 57:6 25:17 31:21 34:24 22 10:8,13 14:16, manufacturer misplaced 18:19 nineteen-five 20 24:11 43:19 27:2 37:25 50:12 45:7 51:16 misread 55:10,22 manufacturers nonproprietary opens 13:19,24 misreading 27:5 27:23 26:6 55:12 mark 54:5 nontaxable 9:18 operate 15:6 misunderstandin marketing 21:20 18:22 19:6 21:25 25:18 g 11:15 30:15 27:20 31:1,5,10 32:17,19 36:25

38:19 39:4 45:22 paperwork 22:17 16:7,9,12,16,18, prescribed 53:1 19,21,22,24 operates 15:2 parameters present 9:2 17:11,14 18:4 31:22 operating 21:17 19:3 57:18,19,22 presentation 22:10 Parker 3:12 6:5 58:1,13 4:10 9:20,22 10:8 14:16 51:16 57:6 operational 15:7 part 9:13 12:2,3, pharmaceuticals 25:15 presented 13:1 39:3 10,23 14:25 15:15 16:7,8 17:14 19:3, **phone** 25:13 operations 32:15 president 8:25 5,13 29:15 31:19 37:12 26:17,18 32:25 37:24 40:5 presumed 15:25 operator 34:9 42:14 46:15 48:14 picking 7:21 pretty 35:3 49:3.10 50:15 **picky** 11:10 operators 20:23 53:1 57:21 58:1,5, price 16:2,6 19:7 opinion 5:20 12 **piece** 14:2 30:17 50:15 13:2,3 30:6 59:17 participants 5:20 **pieces** 13:15 **prices** 31:5 45:13 opposed 47:8 participate 5:22 pioneer 20:16 pricing 23:15 54:8 35:1 38:7 optional 17:20,21 **place** 17:5 25:19 18:21,22 57:25 parties 5:25 8:5 44:5,6,25 45:1 private 10:18 58:5 9:14 12:4 12:25 40:18,25 placement 40:18, oral 59:19 party 8:10 9:24 25 proceedings order 21:16 22:13 2:15 59:24 placements patent 54:5 24:23 34:19 12:25 process 23:9 pay 18:10,14 Organization 25:17 22:18 23:6,10 **places** 37:12 20:19,21 29:2,5 32:3 35:7 processing 15:8 plan 52:25 53:3 original 37:25 produce 5:20 40:11 point 14:7,14 paying 19:10 58:8 27:10 22:23 43:1.8 originally 50:1 47:11 56:8 payment 18:6 producing 31:8 **OTA** 2:6 5:8 pays 53:18 pointed 44:22,23 products 25:12, **OTA's** 5:12 21 people 6:8 11:11 **portal** 26:11 owner 20:13 21:19 22:11 37:8 program 32:7,22 portion 19:6 34:7 45:21 49:10 55:4 22:12 promoting 25:13 position 20:12,14 ownership 46:12 percent 21:22 37:3,23 38:2 properly 32:19 46:13 49:6,7,9 35:5 54:18,21,22 practical 34:9 Ρ **property** 13:15,16 perfect 6:21 7:17 predominance 15:24 16:3,7,9,12, 11:7 12:12 pages 44:17 16,18,19,21,22,24 performance predominantly 17:11,15 18:4 paid 17:18 53:8 16:18 17:9 54:17 19:3 21:19 29:20 panel 3:3.5 5:13. 30:5 33:1 37:5 period 14:8 15:19 preferences 22:7 14,18,22 10:15 43:10 53:11 54:3, 23:10 49:15,23,25 42:19,20 51:7 prehearing 6:24 4 57:18,19,22 50:5 52:9 58:18 59:9, 8:4,5,9 58:2,13 10 person 16:11,13 proposition 19:4 preliminary 6:23 22:22,23 paper 35:18 prepared 33:23 proprietary 10:17 personal 15:24 53:10

prospective quick 58:20 referenced 33:8 representatives 49:16 6:2 referring 51:17 **quote** 55:23 provide 32:3 represents 15:10 **refund** 55:17 39:22 43:11 44:2, R reprogram 47:7 register 21:4 requests 19:15 provided 8:12 registered 10:16 rails 56:1 10:2 11:22,23 36:24 require 22:13 raise 19:23 17:16,19 26:14,23 38:23 53:24 registering 22:12 39:16 40:5 58:22 rare 49:20,22 required 17:18 registration 53:6, provision 17:1,12 18:10 26:24 29:3 rate 31:15 54:20 51:19 40:24 43:3 47:16 read 23:9 55:6,8 regulated 10:22 53:3,20 purchase 13:12 11:17 12:19 13:6 readily 19:7 15:11 17:7 23:13 requirement 29:1 33:12 40:13 regulation 12:24 38:10,18,19 53:7 reading 36:22 45:10,11 46:7,25 16:8 18:24 51:18, 45:24 54:23 requirements 58:24 22 52:2 33:5,16 38:22 ready 5:4 10:5 purchased 50:2 regulations 14:1 14:14,18 59:8,12 requires 13:11 21:8 33:21 53:24 purchaser's 15:11 18:25 40:17 real 16:14 16:14 53:5 reiterate 57:12 reason 37:8 42:4, purchases 38:5 related 15:12 reside 28:1 5,9,13 48:6 purpose 7:15 relates 22:9 respect 18:20 reasonable 17:8 13:23 16:15 26:1 29:23 30:1,5 respond 31:24 reliance 18:18 53:14 44:19 receipts 15:25 relies 18:16 purposes 47:13 16:1 Respondent 3:9 remarks 9:24 push 6:17,18 receive 32:8 response 51:24 reminder 9:10 49:19 **put** 12:13 24:23 rest 29:23 30:4 27:24 31:11 48:7 remove 46:11,21 received 4:4,5 43:9 53:16,22 8:20,22 rendered 19:6 result 18:1 putting 33:3 recommend rendering 16:11, retail 12:1 15:23 48:18 Q retailer 15:23 record 5:5,6,25 renew 46:10,14 8:19 11:3 35:17, retailer's 15:25 report 27:17 question 21:24 23 59:12,13 retails 29:5 24:20 28:24 37:11 reported 2:19 records 10:21 43:13 45:24 46:4, return 54:20 31:23 9 48:1 49:3,13 reporter 2:20 51:15 20:20,24 revenue 15:22 RECROSS 4:16 21:25 24:5 31:8 questioning reports 11:13 redirect 4:16 46:16,17 47:6,7 49:14 51:12.13 56:3,24 49:3,6,8 questions 5:22 represent 6:1,8,9, **reduce** 50:12 ridiculous 22:24 10:6 39:5,9,10,12 10 reduced 50:13 **rights** 13:16 17:4 42:20 45:25 46:2 representative 46:12 53:11 54:3, 51:6,8,10 52:9,11, reference 32:17, 6:25 10:8 19:19 4,5 13 55:6 56:9 20 40:20 43:18,21 42:25 51:10 58:18 59:9

speaking 7:25 **roll** 7:7 54:6 securely 13:21 58:1,5,8,12 **RPR** 2:19 securities 12:23 **speaks** 35:12 **set** 24:16 25:16, 40:13 41:2 18,19 32:14 54:25 56:8 rules 35:2 47:17 55:19 security 13:7 special 47:17 run 18:12,15 sets 7:12 sell 11:18 23:3 specializes 33:23 48:24 29:17 31:4 46:11, settle 28:22 runs 40:12 specific 17:5 14,17,23 55:4 **sheet** 7:10 25:23 26:1 27:3 59:3 45:1 57:12 S shipped 27:2 seller's 47:8 28:20 specifically **selling** 12:1 15:2 25:14 26:2 33:15 Sacramento 2:16 shortly 59:20 17:3 23:15 47:23 39:15 5:1,11 52:24 **show** 10:16 11:22 specifics 43:1 safe 22:11 31:13 43:2 **sells** 17:4 **spells** 39:21 **sale** 9:13 13:12 side 22:3 send 44:16 59:17 14:25 15:16 16:2, sponsoring 21:7 sign 35:8 49:17 6,7,9,17,22 17:14 separable 17:23 sponsorship 19:3,6,14 20:21 significance separate 22:21 21:7 33:12 40:13 35:10 24:22 35:1 36:6,9 57:19,20,21 58:1, **staff** 32:5 40:8 54:6 **similar** 13:6,7 12 **stand** 19:4 34:4, separated 34:4 Similarly 18:13 sales 15:23 16:10 14 36:25 54:14,15 36:25 17:13 18:1 19:14 simple 27:7 standard 27:4 20:19 23:7 27:24 separately 18:24, simply 19:1 31:9 28:21 29:2,5,8 25 33:6,7 37:1 **STAR** 21:7 49:4,6,9 57:20 54:9,14 situation 23:20 **start** 6:1 10:5 San 18:18 56:24 separates 53:23 21:14 42:22 skill 24:16 25:16. **Sarah** 2:19 18,19 32:14 **series** 12:11 started 10:7 13:15 **small** 20:22 34:9 12:23 19:21 48:8 sat 55:18,20 **serves** 40:10 **smarts** 13:23 state 2:2,20 3:9 savings 10:21 6:1,7,8 12:24 13:4 service 16:4,11, software 15:7 scenario 50:8 15:24 16:5 22:13, 13,15,18 17:1,10, 26:23,25 27:6,9, scenarios 23:24 18 33:4,16 36:5 12 18:23 19:3 11,14,18 30:21 37:3 41:5 55:12, 24:19 28:14 34:2 37:19 Scott 3:11 6:4 25 58:11 **services** 10:18,19 sold 13:2 16:3 **scout** 31:16 **stated** 18:24,25 11:16.22.24 17:17 59:1.2 scrap 47:11,16 12:16,20 15:8 **sole** 37:8 16:6,8 17:6,13,14 statement 10:13 search 43:5 19:5,8 20:22 14:20 24:10 **sooner** 59:21 secret 32:23 54:5 21:20 24:14,20, source 38:14 44:8 **states** 13:9 15:24 21,22 26:14,22 section 13:5 18:5 24:13 30:3 31:1,10 32:3 33:5, **sources** 44:3,7 15:22,24 16:1 54:24 6 34:2,3,21,22 45:13 45:8,19 35:12 36:6,8,14 stations 25:13 **SPA** 13:12 Sections 16:5 39:22,25 41:9,24 **statute** 18:24 42:14 43:11 44:2, **space** 48:22 **secure** 14:3,12 33:18.22 38:21 4 51:19 52:3,5,7, 25:19 27:21 31:17 40:16,17 53:3,14, speak 56:17,20 25 54:13 57:21.25

Index: statutorily..two-twist

		4 11	
15,24 54:2,24,25	<b>Suzanne</b> 3:5 5:16	teller 14:24	<b>total</b> 15:4 16:2,5 54:18
statutorily 12:22	<b>swear</b> 19:22	tells 44:6	totally 27:4
statutory 33:5	<b>switch</b> 13:19 26:3	<b>ten</b> 9:24 10:9 48:6, 21 52:17 57:5	touches 41:1
stayed 54:9	sworn 20:3	term 37:15	<b>TPP</b> 58:13
<b>step</b> 14:2	symbols 53:3		
stickers 31:22	<b>system</b> 13:22	terminal 32:8	track 27:20
stream 46:17 47:6	14:3 52:25	terminates 46:5	trade 32:23 54:5
56:20	systems 44:10	terms 30:1,12	trademarks 53:2
Street 2:16	Т	<b>territories</b> 47:24 48:10	<b>train</b> 31:15,16 32:7 56:1
strict 41:2	<u> </u>	territory 48:13	training 15:8
stuff 31:25 32:6	table 32:2 41:8	•	23:11 30:24,25
sub-equipment	tail 54:22	test 16:16	31:10 32:9,11
54:12	takes 37:23	testified 20:4	40:4,5,9 41:20
subcontracted 34:6	taking 37:3 48:22	testifying 39:24	transaction 10:20 15:8 16:17
subject 15:25	56:4	<b>testimony</b> 9:3,22 14:14,17 19:19	17:12 18:20 19:5
16:9 17:13 18:1	talked 39:25 52:1	52:4 57:1,24 58:7,	23:6 25:25 36:3,5
19:14 57:20 58:2	talking 33:6 39:18	21,23	49:7 58:9
submission 7:3	tangible 15:23	thing 13:18,19,24	transactions 16:23 18:3 19:2,
submitted 58:3	16:7,9,12,15,17,	22:3 26:2 30:9	12 25:17 34:24
59:13	19,21,22,24 17:11,14 18:4	37:4,7 38:7 39:3 43:5 45:11 48:11	35:11 42:12 57:13
subsequent 7:3	19:3 57:18,19,22	53:12	58:11
substantial 52:25	58:1,13	things 13:11	TRANSCRIPT 2:15
53:1	tax 2:1 3:10 5:8	22:13,19 31:19	_
sufficient 44:24	6:2 10:6 15:20,23	32:18 40:12,18 47:18 53:23	<b>transfer</b> 16:19,21 24 17:11,25 18:3
<b>sum</b> 19:7	16:1,10 17:13 18:1,22 19:14		57:17,22 58:5,13
summary 8:12	22:14 23:7 28:22	<b>TIE's</b> 46:21	transferred 50:3
9:4,7,25 37:11	29:2,5,8,9 37:7	time 5:9 9:19 10:1,	51:21 54:1
Superior 18:17	53:18 57:20 58:2	2 39:5 40:8,9 41:22 46:13 48:15	Transfers 57:18
•	taxable 9:12,18	50:6 51:13 52:14	translation 14:6
<b>suppliers</b> 44:3 45:14	14:25 15:17,20 16:22 18:8 29:21	55:6	treated 47:20
supplies 15:12	30:9 37:4 58:14	tiny 49:9	
supplies 15.12	Taxation 15:22	today 5:21 9:2,3,	<b>Triton</b> 22:4 23:14 38:2,3,6
	teach 21:19 22:11	16 11:21 58:7,22 59:1,8,11,16	true 16:14 51:19
<b>support</b> 24:17 44:11	telecommunicati	, , ,	
supported 58:2	ons 11:20	today's 5:9,13	<b>Tuman</b> 2:19
	telephone 13:18	tone 54:25	<b>turn</b> 10:7 14:16 19:18 39:8 42:19
supports 57:24	14:11 25:8 26:4	tool 11:19 13:17	52:16 57:5
surcharge 42:11	37:17	14:1 53:17	two-twist 14:10

**type** 21:23

**types** 58:11

**typical** 36:2,5

U

**U.S.** 41:4

understand 37:9

understanding

8:9 22:25 30:2 36:16 41:18

understood

55:18

uniformity 38:23

39:1

**United** 13:9

unreported 15:20

upfront 48:6

٧

**vend** 25:14

vending 25:14

versus 28:22

Visa 31:20

voice 7:22

**volume** 38:7

W

wagging 54:22

wait 23:10

wanted 7:7 48:10

59:1

warranty 18:21

Wednesday 2:18

5:1,9 59:13

wire 14:10

Wireless 26:5

witnesses 4:16

8:24

**work** 21:21 25:20 45:17 46:5,7 47:8

write 27:9

write-off 22:14

writing 45:14

written 5:20 18:9

59:17

Υ

**year** 22:17,19 35:7

49:5

years 28:22 55:3

Youtube 5:12