BEFORE THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA OFFICE OF TAX APPEALS COUNTY OF SACRAMENTO

IN THE MATTER OF THE APPEAL OF:)		
CHANEY FAMILY TRUST)	CASE NO.	220911290
APPELLANT.)		

CERTIFIED COPY

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

Sacramento, California

Tuesday, August 15, 2023

Reported by:

Maria Esquivel-Parkinson, CSR No. 10621, RPR

Job No.: 43169 OTA(A)

1	BEFORE THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
2	OFFICE OF TAX APPEALS
3	COUNTY OF SACRAMENTO
4	
5	
6	IN THE MATTER OF THE APPEAL OF:)
7	CHANEY FAMILY TRUST) CASE NO. 220911290
8	APPELLANT.)
9	·/
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS, taken at
16	Office of Tax Appeals, 400 R Street, Sacramento,
17	California, commencing at 1:02 p.m. and concluding
18	at 1:16 p.m. on Tuesday, August 15, 2023, reported
19	by Maria Esquivel-Parkinson, CSR No 10621, RPR,
20	a Certified Shorthand Reporter in and for the
21	State of California.
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	APPEARANCES
2	
3	PANEL MEMBERS:
4	Amanda Vassigh, Lead Administrative Law Judge
5	Cheryl Akin
6	Mike Le
7	
8	FOR THE APPELLANT:
9	Michael Chaney
LO	
11	FOR THE FTB:
L2	OFFICE OF TAX APPEALS
13	400 R Street Sacramento, California
L4	By: Joel Smith, Tax Counsel
15	
L6	
L7	
18	
L9	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	CHRONOLOGICAL INDEX	
2		
3	EXHIBITS	
4	(Appellant's Exhibit 1 was admitted	l at page 6)
5	(FTB's Exhibits A and B were admitt	ed at page 6)
6		
7		
8		PAGE
9	Appellant's Presentation	7
10	Respondent's Presentation	9
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

1	TUESDAY, AUGUST 15, 2023
2	SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA
3	1:02 P.M.
4	
5	ALJ VASSIGH: We're opening the record in the
6	appeal of Chaney Family Trust, OTA Case No. 220911290.
7	This matter is be held before the Office of Tax Appeals
8	in Sacramento, California. Today's date is Tuesday,
9	August 15th, 2023, and the time is 1:02 p.m.
10	My name is Amanda Vassigh and I'm the lead
11	Administrative Law Judge for this appeal. With me today
12	are Administrative Law Judges Cheryl Akin and Mike Le.
13	My co-panelists and I are equal participants in this
14	appeal.
15	As a reminder, the Office of Tax Appeals is not
16	a court. It's an independent appeals body, and because
17	of our neutral position, we only have the exhibits and
18	arguments the parties have provided in this appeal.
19	So I'm going to have the parties introduce
20	themself and who they represent for the record.
21	Starting with you, Mr. Chaney.
22	THE APPELLANT: Michael Chaney, successor
23	trustee of Chaney Family Trust.
24	ALJ VASSIGH: Thank you.
25	MR. SMITH: Joel Smith, Respondent Franchise

1	Tax Board.
2	ALJ VASSIGH: All right. And as stated in my
3	minutes and orders, the issue to be decided in this
4	appeal is whether the statute of limitation bars
5	Appellant's claim for refund for the 2014 tax year. So
6	we'll move on to the evidence in this appeal.
7	Prior to this hearing, FTB submitted an exhibit
8	index identifying Exhibits A and B that it seeks to
9	introduce into the record as evidence.
10	Mr. Chaney, does Appellant have any objection
11	to FTB's exhibits?
12	THE APPELLANT: No.
13	ALJ VASSIGH: Great. So FTB's Exhibits A and B
14	are now admitted and entered into the record.
15	(FTB's Exhibits A and B admitted.)
16	ALJ VASSIGH: Appellant attached to its opening
17	brief FTB's statute of limitation claim denial notice
18	dated June 30th, 2022. This is being designated as
19	Appellant's Exhibit 1.
20	Mr. Smith, does FTB have any objections to
21	Appellant's exhibit?
22	MR. SMITH: No.
23	ALJ VASSIGH: Appellant's Exhibit 1 is now
24	admitted and entered into the record.
25	(Appellant's Exhibit 1 admitted.)

Τ	ALJ VASSIGH: So I would like to quickly go
2	over the order of the proceedings today. In my orders
3	for this appeal, I laid out the Appellant would have 10
4	minutes for its presentation including your own
5	testimony, Mr. Chaney. Following any questions, FTB
6	will have 10 minutes for their presentation and, then
7	Mr. Chaney, you will have an optional five minutes for
8	rebuttal. With that, I think we're ready to begin.
9	Mr. Chaney, you've indicated to OTA in addition
10	to presenting your argument, you will be giving us some
11	factual testimony, so I'm going to swear you in so we
12	can consider your testimony as part of the evidence in
13	this appeal. I will not be swearing in the Franchise
14	Tax Board because Mr. Smith is not actually providing
15	testimony, only argument. You will remain under oath
16	until the end of this hearing. So please raise your
17	right hand.
18	Do you swear or affirm to tell the truth, the
19	whole truth and nothing but the truth?
20	THE APPELLANT: I do.
21	ALJ VASSIGH: Thank you, Mr. Chaney. You may
22	begin your presentation when you are ready.
23	PRESENTATION
24	BY MICHAEL CHANEY, Appellant:
25	Okay. All I can all I can say is I didn't

find out the statute of limitations until after the filing. I know it was a late filing. The reason is the bequest of my brother because he was on -- on medical disability. For fear of losing that, that's why I delayed on the filing. He passed away this last January, and with that received and filed all the back taxes. This happened to be a sale that I -- that I participated in and rehabbed at the time. And the only reason -- that's the only reason I can say as to why the delay and the only excuse I can have. I know it's no excuse under what I read is that I wasn't aware of the statute of limitations. I'm aware of it now, but it's after the fact.

2.4

I'm trying to explain that to the family since I'm a trustee of a family member. I wanted to. I'm showing up here just out of sheer respect and hopefully some kind of information I can share with them, but I'm kind of embarrassed if he finds out at a later date he wasn't told. I shared earlier, you know, it has nothing -- bearing. It has to do with me. But I went back to the title company thinking I might have signed some documents and overlooked and they hadn't informed me. I was never informed. No paperwork to address the statute of limitations. So addressing that, that's my only excuse at this moment, but I'm looking to the Court

to maybe make some appeal, some adjustment. And
that's -- I guess that's where I stand at this moment.

ALJ VASSIGH: Thank you, Mr. Chaney. I'm sorry for your loss. I appreciate your presentation.

Mr. Smith, we are now ready for Franchise Tax Board's presentation. You have 10 minutes, and you may begin whenever you are ready.

PRESENTATION

BY JOEL SMITH, Tax Counsel:

Good afternoon. My name is Joel Smith. I'm with Respondent Franchise Tax Board. As was mentioned, the lone issue in this appeal is whether Appellant filed his 2014 claim for refund before the expiration of the statute of limitations. As Appellant's successor trustee mentioned the tax return claiming a refund was filed beyond the statute of limitations. Revenue Taxation Code Section 19306 requires that Appellant must file a claim for refund within four years of the original filing due date or one year from the date of overpayment. Neither of those, the four-year statute, nor the one-year statute was met in this appeal.

Respondent is sorry for Mr. Chaney's loss and it recognizes the difficulty losing a family member can cause, however, unfortunately, the statute of limitations is strictly applied. On taxpayers' failure

to file a claim beyond the statutory period for any reason, whether it be ignorance of the law or reasonable cause prevents the taxpayer from doing so at a later date.

Further, Respondent does not have a duty to discover a taxpayer's overpayment or to notify a taxpayer of an overpayment.

There was discussion in the appeal letter with regard to unclaimed property. If you have any questions about the unclaimed property argument, I can answer those questions; however, it was thoroughly briefed in Respondent's opening brief. So based on the evidence in the record and California law, Respondent requests that you sustain its position. I can answer any questions that the panel has. Thank you.

ALJ VASSIGH: Thank you, Mr. Smith.

Before we move on to panel questions for Mr. Smith, I first wanted to see if you had any questions for Mr. Chaney about his factual testimony.

MR. SMITH: I do not.

ALJ VASSIGH: Okay. And I will turn to my panel members and see if you have any questions for either party.

Judge Le?

2.4

ALJ LE: No questions. Thank you.

ALJ VASSIGH: Judge Akin?

2.4

ALJ AKIN: Judge Akin speaking. I don't have questions for either party. Thank you both for your presentations today.

ALJ VASSIGH: Okay. With that, Mr. Chaney, we are -- I also do not have questions for either party, so we are ready for your closing remarks or any rebuttal, any last thoughts you would like to leave us with. You have five minutes. You may begin when you are ready. I've gotten a note that they are having trouble -- they are having trouble hearing you outside of this room. So maybe pull your microphone closer to you. I know that I have to pull it uncomfortably close and make sure that the green light is on.

You may begin.

CLOSING ARGUMENT

BY MR. MICHAEL CHANEY, Appellant:

This moment I'm fully informed at this moment or at the time after the filing. I think it's an unjust, you know, ruling -- or law that would allow that to happen under my circumstances. That's the way I see it. You think that would be more addressed at some point when you get the filing or the title company. I know those -- those are not allegations, but I find that out after the fact -- because it's quite embarrassing

1 for me because I've been taking care of the property, 2 taking care of the books, making sure the filings were 3 done according to the -- basically -- basically was at 4 the request of my brother because of his illness. 5 didn't want to. He was afraid of losing his medical, and he was quite, quite ill at the time, on dialysis and 6 7 I can't believe there is no -- no wiggle room, such. waive room under these circumstances for people like 8 9 myself, and I'm -- I'm thinking there should be more --10 much more information when this -- at least the disclosure of the statute of limitations never an issue 11 addressed to me till after the filing. So I share that 12 as future reference, but hopefully -- hoping -- I was 13 14 hoping there would be some kind of leeway or leniency at 15 this point, but that's -- that's my request and that's 16 my statement. Thank you. 17 ALJ VASSIGH: Thank you, Mr. Chaney. I'm just 18 going to check in with my co-panelists again. 19 Judge Le, do you have any questions? 20 ALJ LE: Again, no questions. Thank you to 21 both parties. 22 ALJ VASSIGH: Thank you. 23 Judge Akin, do you have any questions of either 24 party?

No questions. Thank you.

ALJ AKIN:

25

1	ALJ VASSIGH: Okay. At this point I think we
2	are ready to conclude the hearing. The panel will meet
3	and decide the case based upon the arguments, testimony
4	and the evidence in the record. We aim to issue our
5	written opinion no later than 100 days from today's
6	date. This case is now submitted and the record is
7	closed.
8	I want to thank the parties for their
9	presentation and for driving up to Sacramento. I'd like
10	to thank our legal support staff who worked very hard to
11	ensure that all parties would be able to participate in
12	this hearing today.
13	And thank you, Ms. Parkinson. Thank you to my
14	co-panelists. This concludes this hearing. OTA will
15	resume with the next calendar item in about 15 minutes.
16	Thank you, everyone. Have a good day.
17	(Conclusion of the proceedings at 1:16 p.m.)
18	00
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE
2	STATE OF CALIFORNIA)
3	COUNTY OF SACRAMENTO) ss.
4	I, MARIA ESQUIVEL-PARKINSON, do hereby certify
5	that I am a Certified Shorthand Reporter, and that at
6	the times and places shown I recorded verbatim in
7	shorthand writing all the proceedings in the following
8	described action completely and correctly to the best of
9	my ability: LOCATION: Office of Tax Appeals
10	400 R Street Sacramento, CA 95811
11	CASE: Appeal of Chaney Family Trust Case #220911290
12	DATE: Tuesday, August 15, 2023
13	I further certify that my said shorthand notes
14	have been transcribed into typewriting, and that the
15	foregoing pages 1 through 13 constitute an accurate and
16	complete transcript of all my shorthand writing for the
17	dates and matter specified.
18	I further certify that I have complied with CCP
19	237(a)(2) in that all personal juror identifying
20	information has been redacted if applicable.
21	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have subscribed this
22	certificate at Sacramento, California on this 5th day of
23	September, 2023. Mairas 9 DV
24	Maria Esquivel-Parkinson CSR No. 10621, RPR

-	9	6:5,19,21,23,25 9:14	Chaney 2:7 3:9 5:6,21,22,23 6:10
000 13:18	9 4:10	applied 9:25	7:5,7,9,21,24 9:3 10:19 11:5,17
	3 4.10	argument 7:10,15	12:17
1	Α	10:10 11:16 arguments 5:18	Chaney's 9:22
1 4:4 6:19,23,25	addition 7:9	13:3	check 12:18
10 7:3,6 9:6	address 8:23	attached 6:16	Cheryl 3:5 5:12
100 13:5	addressed 11:22	August 2:18 5:1,9	CHRONOLOGIC AL 4:1
10621 2:19	12:12	aware 8:11,12	circumstances
15 2:18 5:1 13:15	addressing 8:24		11:21 12:8
15th 5:9	adjustment 9:1	В	claim 6:5,17 9:13,
19306 9:17	Administrative	back 8:6,21	18 10:1
1:02 2:17 5:3,9	3:4 5:11,12	bars 6:4	claiming 9:15
1:16 2:18 13:17	admitted 4:4,5 6:14,15,24,25	based 10:12 13:3	close 11:13
	affirm 7:18	basically 12:3	closed 13:7
2	afraid 12:5	bearing 8:20	closer 11:12
2014 6:5 9:13	afternoon 9:10	begin 7:8,22 9:7	closing 11:7,16
2022 6:18	aim 13:4	11:9,15	co-panelists 5:13 12:18 13:14
2023 2:18 5:1,9	Akin 3:5 5:12	bequest 8:3	Code 9:17
220911290 2:7	11:1,2 12:23,25	Board 6:1 7:14 9:11	commencing
5:6	ALJ 5:5,24 6:2,13,	Board's 9:6	2:17
	16,23 7:1,21 9:3 10:16,21,25 11:1,	body 5:16	company 8:21
	2,5 12:17,20,22, 25 13:1	books 12:2	11:23
30th 6:18	allegations 11:24	briefed 10:11	conclude 13:2
	Amanda 3:4 5:10	brother 8:3 12:4	concludes 13:14
4	appeal 2:6 5:6,11,		concluding 2:17
400 2:16	14,18 6:4,6 7:3,13	C	conclusion 13:17 Counsel 3:13 9:9
	9:1,12,21 10:8	calendar 13:15	COUNTY 2:3
6	appeals 2:2,16 3:12 5:7,15,16	California 2:1,17,	
6 4:4,5	APPEARANCES	21 3:13 5:2,8	court 5:16 8:25 CSR 2:19
	3:1	10:13	CSR 2719
7	Appellant 2:8 3:8	care 12:1,2	D
7 4:9	5:22 6:10,12,16 7:3,20,24 9:12,17	case 2:7 5:6 13:3,	
- 1.0	11:17	Certified 2:20	date 5:8 8:18 9:19 10:4 13:6
	appellant's 4:4,9	23.1.100 2.20	

Index: dated..meet

dated 6:18 Judges 5:12 **exhibit** 4:4 6:7,19, Н 21,23,25 day 13:16 June 6:18 exhibits 4:3,5 days 13:5 **hand** 7:17 5:17 6:8,11,13,15 Κ decide 13:3 **happen** 11:21 expiration 9:13 decided 6:3 happened 8:7 **kind** 8:17,18 12:14 explain 8:14 **delay** 8:10 **hard** 13:10 L F delayed 8:5 hearing 6:7 7:16 11:11 13:2,12,14 denial 6:17 **laid** 7:3 fact 8:13 11:25 **held** 5:7 designated 6:18 late 8:2 factual 7:11 10:19 hoping 12:13,14 dialysis 12:6 law 3:4 5:11,12 failure 9:25 10:2,13 11:20 difficulty 9:23 family 2:7 5:6,23 ı **Le** 3:6 5:12 10:24, disability 8:4 8:14,15 9:23 25 12:19,20 identifying 6:8 disclosure 12:11 fear 8:4 **lead** 3:4 5:10 ignorance 10:2 discover 10:6 file 9:18 10:1 **leave** 11:8 **ill** 12:6 discussion 10:8 filed 8:6 9:12,16 **leeway** 12:14 illness 12:4 documents 8:22 filing 8:2,5 9:19 legal 13:10 11:19,23 12:12 including 7:4 driving 13:9 leniency 12:14 filings 12:2 independent **due** 9:19 letter 10:8 5:16 find 8:1 11:24 **duty** 10:5 index 4:1 6:8 light 11:14 finds 8:18 information 8:17 limitation 6:4,17 Ε four-year 9:20 12:10 limitations 8:1, Franchise 5:25 earlier 8:19 **informed** 8:22.23 12.24 9:14.16.25 7:13 9:5,11 11:18 12:11 embarrassed **FTB** 3:11 6:7,20 8:18 introduce 5:19 **lone** 9:12 7:5 6:9 embarrassing losing 8:4 9:23 **FTB's** 4:5 6:11,13, 11:25 issue 6:3 9:12 12:5 15,17 12:11 13:4 end 7:16 loss 9:4,22 fully 11:18 **item** 13:15 **ensure** 13:11 **future** 12:13 М entered 6:14,24 J G **equal** 5:13 **make** 9:1 11:13 **January** 8:6 Esquivelmaking 12:2 giving 7:10 parkinson 2:19 Joel 3:13 5:25 9:9, **Maria** 2:19 good 9:10 13:16 10 evidence 6:6,9 matter 2:6 5:7 7:12 10:12 13:4 **Great** 6:13 Judge 3:4 5:11 10:24 11:1,2 medical 8:3 12:5 **excuse** 8:10,11, green 11:14 12:19,23 25 meet 13:2 guess 9:2

Index: member..statute

provided 5:18 member 8:15 **OTA** 5:6 7:9 13:14 requires 9:17 9:23 overlooked 8:22 providing 7:14 respect 8:16 members 3:3 overpayment **pull** 11:12,13 Respondent 5:25 10:22 9:20 10:6,7 9:11,22 10:5,13 mentioned 9:11, Q Respondent's 15 Ρ 4:10 10:12 met 9:21 questions 7:5 **resume** 13:15 **p.m.** 2:17,18 5:3,9 10:9,11,14,17,19, Michael 3:9 5:22 return 9:15 13:17 22,25 11:3,6 7:24 11:17 12:19,20,23,25 Revenue 9:16 panel 3:3 10:15, microphone 17,22 13:2 quickly 7:1 11:12 room 11:11 12:7,8 paperwork 8:23 Mike 3:6 5:12 **RPR** 2:19 R Parkinson 13:13 minutes 6:3 7:4, ruling 11:20 6,7 9:6 11:9 13:15 part 7:12 raise 7:16 moment 8:25 9:2 S participants 5:13 read 8:11 11:18 participate 13:11 ready 7:8,22 9:5,7 Sacramento 2:3, move 6:6 10:17 11:7,9 13:2 participated 8:8 16 3:13 5:2,8 13:9 reason 8:2,9 10:2 parties 5:18,19 **sale** 8:7 Ν 12:21 13:8,11 reasonable 10:2 Section 9:17 neutral 5:17 party 10:23 11:3,6 rebuttal 7:8 11:7 seeks 6:8 12:24 **note** 11:10 received 8:6 **share** 8:17 12:12 passed 8:5 notice 6:17 recognizes 9:23 shared 8:19 people 12:8 notify 10:6 record 5:5,20 6:9, **sheer** 8:16 period 10:1 14,24 10:13 13:4, Shorthand 2:20 0 point 11:23 12:15 13:1 showing 8:16 reference 12:13 **oath** 7:15 position 5:17 signed 8:21 refund 6:5 9:13, 10:14 objection 6:10 15,18 **Smith** 3:13 5:25 presentation 4:9, 6:20,22 7:14 9:5, objections 6:20 regard 10:9 10 7:4,6,22,23 9,10 10:16,18,20 Office 2:2,16 3:12 rehabbed 8:8 9:4,6,8 13:9 speaking 11:2 5:7,15 remain 7:15 presentations **staff** 13:10 one-year 9:21 11:4 remarks 11:7 stand 9:2 opening 5:5 6:16 presenting 7:10 reminder 5:15 10:12 Starting 5:21 prevents 10:3 reported 2:18 opinion 13:5 **State** 2:1,21 Prior 6:7 Reporter 2:20 optional 7:7 stated 6:2 proceedings represent 5:20 order 7:2 2:15 7:2 13:17 statement 12:16 request 12:4,15 orders 6:3 7:2 **property** 10:9,10 **statute** 6:4,17 8:1, requests 10:13 12:1 12,24 9:14,16,20, original 9:19

Index: statutory..years

21,24 12:11	TRANSCRIPT		
statutory 10:1	2:15		
Street 2:16 3:12	trouble 11:10,11		
strictly 9:25	Trust 2:7 5:6,23		
submitted 6:7 13:6	trustee 5:23 8:15 9:15		
successor 5:22	truth 7:18,19		
9:14	Tuesday 2:18 5:1,		
support 13:10	8		
sustain 10:14	turn 10:21		
swear 7:11,18	U		
swearing 7:13			
	unclaimed 10:9,		
T	10		
taking 12:1,2	uncomfortably 11:13		
tax 2:2,16 3:12,13 5:7,15 6:1,5 7:14	unjust 11:20		
9:5,9,11,15	V		
Taxation 9:17			
taxes 8:7	Vassigh 3:4 5:5, 10,24 6:2,13,16,		
taxpayer 10:3,7	23 7:1,21 9:3		
taxpayer's 10:6	10:16,21 11:1,5		
taxpayers' 9:25	12:17,22 13:1		
testimony 7:5,11, 12,15 10:19 13:3	W		
themself 5:20	waive 12:8		
thinking 8:21 12:9	wanted 8:15 10:18		
thoughts 11:8	wiggle 12:7		
till 12:12	worked 13:10		
time 5:9 8:8 11:19 12:6	written 13:5		
title 8:21 11:23	Υ		
today 5:11 7:2 11:4 13:12	year 6:5 9:19		
today's 5:8 13:5	years 9:18		
told 8:19			