BEFORE THE OFFICE OF TAX APPEALS STATE OF CALIFORNIA

D. NORMAN,) OTA NO. 240416011) APPELLANT.)	ΙN	THE	MATTER	OF	THE	APPEAL	OF,)			
APPELLANT.)	D.	NORI	MAN,)	OTA	NO.	240416011
\					Al	PPELLAN'	г.)			

TRANSCRIPT OF ELECTRONIC PROCEEDINGS

State of California

Wednesday, January 22, 2025

Reported by: ERNALYN M. ALONZO HEARING REPORTER

1	BEFORE THE OFFICE OF TAX APPEALS
2	STATE OF CALIFORNIA
3	
4	
5	
6	IN THE MATTER OF THE APPEAL OF,) D. NORMAN,) OTA NO. 240416011
7)
8	APPELLANT.))
9	,
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	Transcript of Electronic Proceedings,
15	taken in the State of California, commencing
16	at 3:30 p.m. and concluding at 3:46 p.m. on
17	Wednesday, January 22, 2025, reported by
18	Ernalyn M. Alonzo, Hearing Reporter, in and
19	for the State of California.
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	APPEARANCES:			
2	Administrative Law Judge:	JUDGE SHERIENE RIDENOUR		
3				
4	For the Appellant:	D. NORMAN		
5	For the Respondent:	STATE OF CALIFORNIA		
6	TOT the Respondent.	FRANCHISE TAX BOARD		
7		JEFFREY GATES BRADLEY COUTINHO		
8		DIVIDEEL COOLLING		
9				
10				
11				
12				
13				
14				
15				
16				
17				
18				
19				
20				
21				
22				
23				
24				
25				

1	<u>INDEX</u>					
2						
3	<u>EXHIBITS</u>					
4						
5	(Appellant's Exhibit 1 was previously received into evidence at the Prehearing Conference.) (Department's Exhibits A-C were previously received into evidence at the Prehearing Conference.)					
6						
7						
8						
9	<u>PRESENTATION</u>					
10	DACE					
11	PAGE 7					
12	By Mr. Norman 7					
13	By Mr. Gates 11					
14						
15	CLOSING STATEMENT					
16	<u>PAGE</u>					
17	By Mr. Norman 14					
18						
19						
20						
21						
22						
23						
24						
25						

1	California; Wednesday, January 22, 2025
2	3:30 p.m.
3	
4	JUDGE RIDENOUR: We are opening the record in the
5	Office of Tax Appeals oral hearing for the Appeal of
6	Dejuan Norman, OTA Case Number 240416011. Today's date is
7	January 22nd, 2025, and the time is 3:30. This hearing is
8	being conducted virtually with the agreement of the
9	parties.
10	This appeal is being heard and decided by a
11	single Administrative Law Judge under OTA's Small Case
12	Program. My name is Sheriene Ridenour, and I will be
13	conducting the hearing, reviewing the evidence, and
14	reaching a determination in this appeal.
15	For the record, will the parties state their
16	names and who they represent, starting with the
17	representatives for FTB.
18	MR. GATES: My name is Jeffrey Gates. I'm an
19	attorney with FTB.
20	MR. COUTINHO: Good afternoon. My name is Brad
21	Coutinho, and I'm an attorney with the Franchise Tax
22	Board.
23	JUDGE RIDENOUR: And, Mr. Norman, just state your
24	name please.

MR. NORMAN: My name is Dejuan Norman.

25

JUDGE RIDENOUR: Thank you very much. Thanks.

As stated in my Minutes and Orders dated

January 7th, 2025, there is one issue in this appeal;

whether Appellant's claim for refund for the 2018 tax year
is barred by statute of limitations.

2.1

2.4

The exhibits are listed in an exhibit log, which has been distributed to the parties.

During the prehearing conference, FTB raised no objection to Appellant's Exhibit 1, and it was admitted into evidence. During the prehearing conference,

Appellant raised no objections to FTB's Exhibits A through C, and they were admitted into evidence.

As for witnesses, FTB previously indicated it will not call any witnesses. Appellant indicated he will be testifying today, and FTB raised no objections. As such, Mr. Norman will be sworn in before his presentation. There are no other witnesses today.

As a reminder to the parties, during a prehearing conference, we decided that Appellant will have 15 minutes to make his presentation, followed by FTB, who will have 10 minutes. Then Appellant will have 5 minutes to provide closing remarks, should he choose. Each party is encouraged to monitor their own time.

Does anyone have any questions before we move on to presentations?

1	Mr. Norman?
2	MR. NORMAN: No.
3	JUDGE RIDENOUR: Okay. Mr. Gates?
4	MR. GATES: No questions.
5	JUDGE RIDENOUR: Okay. Hearing none, before we
6	proceed with presentations, Mr. Norman, I need to place
7	you under oath so that we can consider your statements as
8	testimony, and you will remain under oath until the
9	closing of this hearing.
10	Will you please raise your right hand.
11	
12	D. NORMAN,
13	produced as a witness, and having been first duly sworn by
14	the Administrative Law Judge, was examined, and testified
15	as follows:
16	
17	JUDGE RIDENOUR: Okay. Thank you. Mr. Norman,
18	the time is 3:33 p.m. When you're ready, please begin
19	your presentation.
20	
21	PRESENTATION
22	MR. NORMAN: Well, back in 2018 at this time,
23	my I was I was having a lot of life stuff going on
24	at this time. This is my first time even being associated
25	with something like this. So back then I was trying to

at that time, I was trying to get to -- I had a lot of deaths going on, and I was abusing alcohol. So to be really honest, this -- this situation, handling my tax business, wasn't my first choice to even start handling this business.

2.1

2.4

So as time progressed and went on and on, the years started going by, and it was time from -- I was trying to get my life back in order, which I end up doing. So the whole thing was that when I -- when I filed this, I'm just not understanding because when -- when I recently did reach out to FTB, the State, they asked -- they -- they told me that I can't go no further to clean up my taxes without getting my prior years done to be in -- what they call it? -- to be in good standings to be able to do my future taxes. So I had to catch up. If you look at my taxes now, I have caught up with all my taxes up to the current year.

So with me not doing taxes -- and I don't know the law, so I can't really state what, you know, what statute of limitations is upon payment or anything like that. That's why I'm here now. So I'm just a learning experience. So now I know. But, you know, it's not really no excuses. Like, the only thing I really have to say is, like, I was going through a lot of life situations, and filing my taxes was the last thing on my

mind at that time.

2.4

Yes, I know the State of California have laws, but I don't do taxes, and I don't know the state laws. So that's why I'm here right now trying to figure out -- you know, I just don't understand this. The problem is if I owed the State any funds, they would grant that. They would grant that. Don't matter -- don't matter what year you owe them, and they will want you to do some kind of payment plan or something like that. But on the other hand is when they owe you, now it's the statute of limitations. See, it's -- it's as I said, make it make sense to me. I just don't know. So I guess this is why I'm here. So I'm just trying to get some understanding.

At least, you know, I -- I just figured that, you know, I work for this -- these funds, and I'm -- I'm getting held accountable for a law of statute of limitations. So if this was the reason why I'm not getting my funds, why I was instructed to catch up -- to catch back up on my -- on my taxes?

Hello?

JUDGE RIDENOUR: Yeah, I can hear you. I'm just taking notes.

MR. NORMAN: Oh, okay. My screen where some kind of -- somehow my screen is -- some type of screen.

JUDGE RIDENOUR: Are you okay, Mr. Norman?

1 MR. NORMAN: Yeah, my screen, something had 2 happened to my screen. 3 Okay. Well, I'm -- I'm just not understanding, so that's -- this is where I'm at with the whole process, 4 5 and this is all new to me. And like I say, at the time, 6 my taxes and stuff wasn't really the big issue at the 7 I had to get myself together. I was going through time. a lot of family's deaths, and -- and it -- it was just 8 9 some bad stuff going on at the time. So, and that's --10 the -- that's where I stand. 11 JUDGE RIDENOUR: Thank you, Mr. Norman. 12 FTB, do you have any questions for Mr. Norman as a witness? 13 14 MR. GATES: No questions. 15 JUDGE RIDENOUR: Okay. At this time, I don't 16 have any questions either. I do want to commend you, 17 Mr. Norman, for getting your life where you want it. 18 must have been an uphill battle, so congratulations and be 19 proud of yourself. 20 MR. NORMAN: Yeah. 21 JUDGE RIDENOUR: Okay. The time is 3:37. When 22 you're ready, Mr. Gates, please begin your presentation. 23 MR. GATES: Thank you. /// 2.4 /// 25

PRESENTATION

2.4

MR. GATES: My name is -- good afternoon. My name is Jeffrey Gates, and with me today is Bradley Coutinho. We're here on behalf of Respondent Franchise Tax Board, FTB. And as we're aware the issue at hand is whether or not Mr. Norman's claim for refund for 2018 tax year was made within the statute of limitations.

And I guess the first thing that we really need to look at is the statute of limitations itself. There's four refund claims. The statute of limitations allows for someone to file a claim for refund within four years of when the return was originally due, and that's under Revenue & Tax Code 19306. Now, the return for the 2018 tax year was due on April 15th, 2019, and Mr. Norman filed his claim on April 10th, 2024, when he filed his 2018 tax return.

Now, the statute of limitations had expired approximately a year before that on April 15th of 2023. So it's not within the four-year statute of limitations. There's also a one-year statute of limitations where a claim can be filed within one year of a payment. Now, the payment at issue here is, as Mr. Norman had mentioned earlier, there were taxes paid to California. And this was done through withholding. But Code
Section 19002(c)(1) says that withholding credits, they're

deemed paid for the purposes of the statute of limitations on the return due date. So because of that, again, the return due date was in 2019, and the claim for refund was filed, you know, more than one year beyond that date.

2.4

Now, as far as the case law is concerned, there is no equitable tolling for the statute of limitations. And that was said under the McFeaters case, and this was State Board of Equalization case from 1994. Now, there is however, a statutory ability to extend that -- or toll that statute of limitations, and this is under section 19316 of the Code. It's also discussed in the Case of Gillespie, which is an Office of Tax Appeals opinion from 2018. Now, the statute will be tolled if the person is financially disabled, which means that they have an impairment that is either terminal or is expected to last longer than 12 months. So in those cases, as long as it overlaps with the limitation period for the claim that the statute can be tolled.

Now, here Mr. Norman has provided us with a physician's affidavit, and it states that he could not manage his financial affairs between November 4th, 2019, and January 10th, 2020, which is a period of about three months. So, unfortunately, Mr. Norman's disability because it was less than 12 months, and it was not a terminal impairment, he wouldn't qualify for that tolling

period. And it's understandable, and it is sometimes difficult to accept, but the law, other than this financial disability section, doesn't allow for refunds after the time limit for making the claim -- for when the claim is expired.

And as much as we may sympathize with Mr. Norman's past difficulties and respect his determination for -- and growth that he's displayed to improve his life, the law simply does not allow for a refund claim to be outside of the statute of limitations in this instance.

I'd like to thank you for your time and attention, Judge Ridenour, and we'll be happy to answer any questions you may have for us.

JUDGE RIDENOUR: Thank you very much, Mr. Gates. At this time, I don't have any questions.

Mr. Norman, just to clarify on the record, there is a statute of limitations for FTB to make assessments as well. I know that's not at issue, but I did hear you say about owing money. So I just want to clarify there are statute of limitations for that as well. Having said that -- oh, would you like to say something, Mr. Norman?

25 ///

2.1

2.4

CLOSING STATEMENT

2.1

2.4

MR. NORMAN: So when would there be statute of limitations of that? Because I was told today -- I asked -- when I asked the tax preparer, and I asked her the same question today, because I knew I was coming on today. She's preparing my taxes for 2019. She was -- 2019 taxes I was missing also. She -- she prepared. So she says it's not no statute of limitations if you owe the state. So now it's a -- it -- it is the statute -- because I'm not -- that's -- this is where I'm getting confused at because the problem is that -- that's why I said if you owe the state -- basically to make a long story, if you owe the State, they want -- they want their payment.

And when I just -- I just felt is that -- is because I paid before the statement, they garnish on my check. But it's I just feels that when they owe me, now we have a problem. So you see whereas -- you know, I had to go through all this to get my funds. Yes, I do pay into the taxes. I pay taxes when I'm working. Yes, you are correct about that. But I know the law is the law, but I'm not -- you know, like I said before, this was the last thing I was thinking about even doing. That's why I'm catching back up and getting all my business handled because I was -- like I said, I was in the dark for a

while. And I know it's the law people. You know, it's -it's not no problem. I mean, stuff happens in people's
lives, you know.

2.4

And, you know, I just didn't know. I -- I still don't do taxing. I still don't know the law. So I'm -- I'm still kind of in the rut, but I -- my mother would -- my mother does taxes. And she stated to me, she said, well, you ask them what is the -- when they told you to do your taxes, why they didn't state that this could happen from the get. She -- I had to be -- like I said, I had to -- for me to get to where I'm at now, everything had to be filed. Or I couldn't file my regular taxes because they would want the recent -- the past ones done first and then go -- then I could go to my present. So this is where I'm -- I'm at -- I'm stuck at. Yes, I know it's the law and -- but I thought it was, you know -- I --

JUDGE RIDENOUR: No. Okay. I will include some information in my opinion as to the statute of limitations for assessments just to kind of clarify a little bit for you because I understand it can be confusing for someone who doesn't understand taxes. It's completely understandable. So I will include that information to help clarify things for you in my opinion. And -- yeah. So hopefully that will give you some light as to the situation for that as well. Having said that, you have

1 time for closing remarks or statements, should you want to 2 speak more about the issue. You have up to --3 MR. NORMAN: No. I'm -- that's -- it's, you know, I'm fine. Just like I say, I got myself into this 4 5 situation and, you know, if it's the law, it's the law. 6 But, you know, I like -- at least I can try to fight 7 for -- you know, which I think I deserve to have. But that's it. 8 9 JUDGE RIDENOUR: And you have every right to do 10 That's why we offer you this appeals process. 11 hopefully my opinion, whichever way I should decide, will 12 help give clear -- light some knowledge into the issue for 13 you. Okay.

MR. NORMAN: All right.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

2.4

25

JUDGE RIDENOUR: I want thank you for your closing remarks and your presentation, Mr. Norman and Mr. Gates.

I do not have any questions for either party at this time. And so I want to thank everyone for participating in today's hearing. I am now concluding the hearing. The record is now closed.

I will issue a written opinion of my decision within 100 days of today. That concludes today's hearing in the Appeal of Dejuan Norman, and it is now closed.

(Proceedings adjourned at 3:46 p.m.)

1 HEARING REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE 2 I, Ernalyn M. Alonzo, Hearing Reporter in and for 3 the State of California, do hereby certify: 4 5 That the foregoing transcript of proceedings was 6 taken before me at the time and place set forth, that the 7 testimony and proceedings were reported stenographically 8 by me and later transcribed by computer-aided 9 transcription under my direction and supervision, that the 10 foregoing is a true record of the testimony and 11 proceedings taken at that time. 12 I further certify that I am in no way interested 13 in the outcome of said action. 14 I have hereunto subscribed my name this 19th day 15 of February, 2025. 16 17 18 19 ERNALYN M. ALONZO 20 HEARING REPORTER 21 2.2 23 2.4 25